

March 28, 2019 HEX Meeting

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MEETING OF THE
COLLIER COUNTY HEARING EXAMINER
Naples, Florida
March 28, 2019

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, that the Collier County Hearing Examiner, in and for the County of Collier, having conducted business herein, met on this date at 9:00 a.m., in REGULAR SESSION at 2800 North Horseshoe Drive, Room 609/610, Naples, Florida, with the following people present:

HEARING EXAMINER MARK STRAIN

ALSO PRESENT: Raymond V. Bellows, Zoning Manager
John Kelly, Senior Planner
Scott Stone, Assistant County Attorney

--- P R O C E E D I N G S ---

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Good morning everyone. Welcome to the Thursday, March 28th meeting of the Collier County Hearing Examiner's Office. If everybody will please rise for the Pledge of Allegiance.

(The Pledge of Allegiance was recited in unison.)

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Thank you. We have some housekeeping matters to discuss. Discussion -- the presentations -- well, not presentations -- the discussions, speakers will be limited to five minutes unless otherwise waived. Decisions are final unless appealed to the Board of Collier County Commissioners and a decision will be rendered within 30 days.

And one other announcement, the older fellow on my right hand here, his birthday is today. I heard it. He just told someone he's 47 years old. So I think he exaggerates a little bit. I don't know why he'd want to be older, but happy birthday, Scott.

And review of the agenda, other than his birthday, we have two advertised public hearings. The first petition is Number CU-PL20170003317. It's the Beraca -- Beraca Baptist Church. It's in Immokalee. All those who wish to testify on behalf of this item, please rise to be sworn in by the court reporter. If you're going to speak, please rise to be sworn in.

THE COURT REPORTER: Do you all swear the testimony you're about to give will be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth?

(The speakers were duly sworn and indicated in the affirmative.)

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Thank you. Disclosures on my part. I have -- I think, you know, talked to staff a couple of times and the applicant's representative came in this morning and we chatted for just a minute. Other than that, I read all of the files and no other disclosures. So that we understand whether or not a presentation is needed today, is there anybody here in opposition of this particular request?

(No response.)

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. Bob, would you mind explaining --

MR. MULHERE: It isn't me.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: I thought it --

MR. MULHERE: This is the church.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Oh, you're the second one?

MR. MULHERE: Yeah.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. Then I haven't -- the only one I've talked to is the staff. Whosever is making the presentation for the church, would you mind coming up to the podium and identify yourself for the record? That over there.

MR. DEAZA: Good morning, everybody. I'm Ronny Deaza with RDA Consulting Engineers.

THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry, your name?

MR. DEAZA: Ronny, R-O-N-N-Y. Deaza, D-E-A-Z-A, with RDA Consulting Engineers. I'm talking on behalf of the church where this piece of land would have an existent residence that is going to be transformed into a church. That piece of land is 3.53 acres and we are at the corner of Lake Trafford and Liberty Way and there's going to be a 24-foot driveway going out to Lake Trafford. And this church is going to be for 75 seats and about 65 attendants. Correct? And the services, there's going to be Fridays and Sundays. No. Wednesday and Sundays. And it's limited by whatever stipulations we put on paper. Two services on Sunday, one in the morning and one in the afternoon.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. Staff has reviewed your project and in the staff report there was a list of recommendations. Are you familiar with those?

MR. DEAZA: Correct.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: You are familiar with them?

MR. DEAZA: Yes.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. Do you have any objections to any of them?

MR. DEAZA: No.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: For the benefit of the members of the public that are here, I will go through those one at a time so everybody knows what those restrictions are.

Number one is with the exception of the parking area. The church shall use -- shall be limited to that which is depicted on the conceptual site plan. The depicted parking area may be expanded to accommodate required off-street parking for the church to use in the event the petitioner does not seek an administrative parking reduction. The hours of operation will be weekdays 7:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m. and weekends 9:00 a.m. to 9:00 p.m. The weekday, Friday, the weekend being Sunday.

Now, does that mean that on Fridays your hours of operation will be seven to nine and on Sunday it's going to be nine to nine, because you say weekend, but then in the second recommendation by staff it looks like weekend is limited to Sundays. Was that your intent?

MR. DEAZA: Correct.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. So you're not going to have any services on Saturday?

MR. DEAZA: No, no services on Saturday.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. Number of seats provided by the church will be limited to 75 seats. The applicant shall be limited to only one principle structure at approximately 4,442 square feet. Perimeter fencing shall be repaired and maintained by the property owner in accordance with the land development code prior to the issuance of the CEO for the church and the subject location. Now that means before you can start using the building as a church, your fence has to be up to standards.

MR. DEAZA: Correct.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: And then Number six, for services and other periods and events of significant traffic generation as determined by Collier County staff, the property owner shall provide traffic control by law enforcement. That's most likely for special events and things like that and that's pretty standard, so --

With that I do have -- a letter was received actually this morning and I would like to read the issues that are in that letter so we can make sure they're either addressed or you've responded to them. And with that, and I'll ask John to jump in.

John, if you've had conversations, you can clarify it. There are four bullets on the letter. One of them was to eliminate the access way to Liberty Way. I see that's been done on the site plan.

MR. DEAZA: Correct.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Ironically I looked at Liberty Way and it's owned by Habitat. It's not a public road necessarily. It's a Habitat road so you really couldn't have gone on that road anyway, so I think that's a good correction.

The hours of operation will be limited, and that's what the letter is asking for. They are. The applicant indicated they would fix the perimeter fence and maintain it. That's been taken care of. I just read that provision. Then the last item is the applicant indicated they would address parking lot screening from Liberty Way by installing the required landscape

buffer. And so I wanted to understand from staff what the landscape buffer would be around that parking lot. I didn't see it on the plans and that's why I was wondering, John, do you know offhand what that will be?

MR. KELLY: No, I don't. I believe the applicant may know if that was a B buffer.

MR. DEAZA: Tell you in a second. We have a ten feet type D landscape buffer on the east side of the property.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: On the east side of the property. John, can you put this on the overhead? Just take that with you. The first one is all I need to show.

MR. KELLY: Okay. And for the record, John Kelly, senior planner.

MR. STONE: If I may? The site plan does show a type D buffer. There's a label for it.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: It shows it there, yes. I was wondering if there was going to be a parking lot buffer as well. Sometimes we look at a three-foot hedge around the parking lot parking spaces and I didn't know if that was the intent, or if this was the buffering that was intended. It's hard to see on that diagram.

MR. BENOIT: Do you want me to dim the lights?

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: That would be helpful. On that photograph it shows a chain link fence and I'm assuming that's the one that may need some repairs in some locations, and that's the fence you'll be retaining.

MR. DEAZA: Correct. The repairs were done already.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. You see the buffer that's there? If you were to put --

John, could you put the other photograph on now that I gave it to you?

MR. BENOIT: Sure. Absolutely.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: The buffer as it goes south along the prop -- along the roadway is higher, and that higher buffer is supposed to be maintaining the full length of the fence area. So the only thing I'd like to note, and it will be noted in this discussion on this and the writeup, that the buffer will have to be completed or filled in to the points that the opacity isn't met. You do have some time before the opacity has to be reached from after you plan. That's all in the code. But I want to make sure that you understand, that buffer will have to be --

MR. DEAZA: Understood.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: -- brought back to full compliance. And, John, do you see anything wrong with that?

MR. KELLY: No.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. And that buffer is on your plan along Liberty Way and that will suffice in lieu of one up along the parking lot itself, which we have done in some commercial applications. Actually, I think it's better along Liberty Way. It's a much longer and closer to the residents as over on the east, so that's probably an improvement.

Other than that, that's the four items that were on that list from the -- Ms. Lazara who is the director of community engagement for Habitat for Humanity on Liberty Way. I don't have any other questions at this point.

And John, any -- as far as that letter goes, do you have any other issues that are outside that letter we haven't addressed?

MR. KELLY: No, sir.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: The other question I do have. On your site plan you show a future 20-foot interconnection to the north of the property. What are you connecting to up there?

MR. DEAZA: It was recommended by the county staff just to have that interconnection in between those two properties so we added it in.

MR. KELLY: That came from transportation staff. Or rather, I'm sorry, that came from, I believe it was Corby Schmitt with --

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: But it doesn't go anywhere. It goes to a private property to the north. Why would we do that?

MR. KELLY: It was just suggested by comprehensive planning.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Do you have a problem if that requirement is removed from your site plan?

MR. DEAZA: Not at all.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay.

MR. DEAZA: Not at all. We can remove it during the SUB process.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: No. I couldn't -- it serves no regulatory purpose whatsoever, so I don't see it as a need.

MR. DEAZA: Understood.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Do you have anything?

MR. STONE: Just if you could revise the site plan to remove that label, if that's the direction that you'd like to take.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: When we're finished today -- we have one gentleman or more that may speak. If there's not any other changes as we finish, any corrections that are needed to the site plan will have to be added and this will be the only one on the site plan.

MR. DEAZA: We'll do it right away.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: The other items will be stipulated. You'll have to send a new site plan to staff so they can send it to me.

MR. DEAZA: We'll do.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: And we can make sure it's incorporated. Okay. That's all I have. So thank you and I'll --

MR. DEAZA: Thank you.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: -- ask the speakers if anybody has anything that you need to address, we may call you back up.

MR. DEAZA: Thank you.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. Thank you.

Staff report.

MR. KELLY: The staff recommends approval with the recommendations that have been stipulated in the staff report and staff concurs with those that you have just stipulated as well.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. Short and sweet, John. Thank you.

As far as members of the public, does anybody in the public wish to speak on this matter?

Sir, if you want to come up to microphone, identify yourself for the record we'll be glad to hear from you.

MR. SANTIAGO: Hello. I am Arthur Santiago.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Can you spell your last name for the court reporter?

MR. SANTIAGO: Santiago?

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Yeah, for the court reporter.

MR. SANTIAGO: Oh, I'm sorry.

THE COURT REPORTER: That's okay.

MR. SANTIAGO: Santiago, S-A-N-T-I-A-G-O.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Thank you.

MR. SANTIAGO: I live -- what is it, just west of the property. This is actually on Liberty Way on the other side of, obviously of where they want to build the church. I live just west of that. There's a creek that separates us and there is a, I believe it's about a 30-acre piece of property behind me as well. I believe it belongs to somebody else. Somebody private.

I don't want to see a church put up next to my house. I have been there 16 years. It's nice and quiet. You know, we've had issues with Habitat before and we've had to put up a fence and we had to put up an eight-foot fence that separates our property from Habitat on the other side. The property owner that had this house before had to put up a fence as well just to, you know, kind of maintain it, you know. It was a big hassle. You know, I don't know if putting this church is going to change our property tax, the property value. I mean, it's going to be -- if the church does, you know, if it does go through, I don't -- I don't think it's going to be a good idea as far as, you know, as a property owner next to it.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Are you at 3704 Lake Trafford Road?

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes, sir.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. We've got an aerial that was supplied by staff. I can see your house. So on the west side of your property you've got some high density residential area there.

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes, sir. Habitat.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: That's a Habitat project as well?

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes, sir. That actually -- it loops actually from this road here and it goes all the way around. It's like a big horseshoe.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: I understand.

MR. SANTIAGO: So --

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: So you've got basically Habitat on both sides of you with the exception of this house that was there?

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes, sir. Yes, sir.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: The allowance to have a house on this, or a church on this property is a right.

MR. SANTIAGO: Okay.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: They've just got to be as compatible as possible.

MR. SANTIAGO: Okay.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: That's why we look at things like buffers and the hours of operation. There are churches in Collier County that have come in most recently through this office, they are not nearly as restricted in their hours of operation and things they want to do for services as this community is offering.

MR. SANTIAGO: Uh-huh.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: The reason I'm telling you that is because the outcome of this property being sold to another entity possibly for another use could be more intense than what you're seeing here. For example, more housing. So from that perspective, a church of this magni -- of this size and with the restrictions they've put on themselves, might be more compatible than a more crowded residential area that could come in --

MR. SANTIAGO: Yeah.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: -- for a rezone. I'm not saying it's the best world, I'm just saying --

MR. SANTIAGO: Yeah, yeah.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: -- there's a possibility that things could be worse. The urban area that along the coast here is filling in with all kinds of stuff that's making it very cramped for folks who have been here like me and -- have you been here 16 years?

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes, sir.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Yeah. I've been here 43. So we've seen a lot of changes and it's --

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes, yes.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: -- and it's crowding us in. I understand that.

MR. SANTIAGO: Yeah.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: One of the things I noticed on the site plan here is that the area that's on your side. The creek is obviously not going to get filled in. Their preservation area is on that side of the property.

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes, sir.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: So, at least that won't be disturbed. Now, as it gets down by you, they have a set -- first of all, they can't change any of the buildings that are there. Right now the building footprints are locked in too. They can renovate the inside, they can make some changes that are nominal, that aren't substantial, but basically it's locked in as it is. So there won't be any greater impact from the building. And the parking lot is on the other side of the lot, which I think --

MR. SANTIAGO: So the houses themselves are staying there?

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: The houses --

MR. SANTIAGO: -- they're just remodeling --

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: The houses -- the church --

MR. SANTIAGO: -- the inside.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: There's two houses --

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: -- one is suggested they might be demoed, the one in back, but the one in the front is as a proposed church.

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes. Yeah. The small one in the back is, I think, a little bit older.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: And that's the one that says existing structure to be demoed prior to obtaining your CO. So that's probably going to come out before the church starts to operate.

MR. SANTIAGO: Okay.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: And the interconnection to the parcel to the north, I'm suggesting they take out. And the reason for that is it just would make this property busier than it needed to be if there was ever an interconnection put in. And the interconnection goes nowhere, so --

MR. SANTIAGO: Yes.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: And with the parking lot over to the east, this is probably as positioned as best it can for a new development coming in near you. I'm just offering that up as a comment from the experience I've seen of new projects coming through, so. I appreciate your comments today. Thank you very much.

MR. SANTIAGO: Thank you.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. Anybody else wish to speak on this issue? Sir, come on up and please identify yourself for the record.

MR. SAINT LOUIS: Good morning everyone. My name is Evens Saint Louis. E-V-E-N-S. Saint Louis, S-A-I-N-T, space, L-O-U-I-S. I am the pastor of the Beraca Baptist Church. So I want to say that the church has been there since 1994 and we are tremendously concentrated to the community. We have provided teachers, nurses. We have provided several officers in the Army and also the Corporal -- the Marine Corps. One of them is Tjeunie Saint Louis. She's a Westman grad. She came from our church. So, we have been servicing the area in a good way. That means we help the youth in the area from going to drugs to cocaine to other stuff just to help them. We help them spiritually but we support them economically as well. Because every year we help those that are graduated from high school. We give them some money before they go to college. So we are not a church just talking the word, presenting the word of God, but we support people as well.

So, the other thing I would like to stress on is that when we meet, we meet seven to nine inside. You know, there is no noise to disturb anybody. If you pass by our church where we are at this time, you would not hear any noise from the outside because everything is confined within. So I'm happy that you are giving us the time for this setting to us to have this meeting this morning. And I'm very optimistic that everything will be working in a good way for the church, for the kingdom of God, but as well to support those in Immokalee. Especially the members of our Beraca Baptist Church, but those that are in the area of Lake Trafford and Habitat. From the neighbor, we'd be very glad to work with the neighbor. Because where we are, we are close to Days Elementary School between Habitat Way and also Lake Trafford. And all the area is mostly businesses. You have Winn Dixies and other stores in the area. So we believe that if we are given the possibility to build the church there, everything will be fine. So, we will be there to support people. We will be there just to continue to do the work that God has given us to do. Thank you.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: One question for you. Based on your neighbor's comments. You're the west side of your property about -- from the west side of the existing building, which is your proposed church, over to the property line where your neighbor lives. There is a creek. You have some preserve area to the north.

MR. SAINT LOUIS: Yes.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: And I noticed to the south there isn't -- there's a lot of trees on your site plan. Is it your intention to do any clearing on that property?

MR. SAINT LOUIS: According to the engineer, it depends on the need. When they are doing the parking, you have things that -- there are some trees that can be moved just for the parking. After that, I cannot provide more. The engineer can give you more details about that.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: I guess then from -- I got to, while you're standing there I'll ask staff, how can they clear this property for additional parking if it's not part of the conditional use?

MR. BELLOWS: For the record, Ray Bellows. They're subject to the conceptual site plan and if they have intended to have expanded parking, it should have been part of a future phase.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. And that's important for your neighbor. I mean, you've got most of your parking over on the opposite side of the partial. That's a good thing.

MR. SAINT LOUIS: Okay.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: You've got a lot of nice vegetation from the western edge of the house over to his property, which is about 50 or 60 feet. If you had intended to take that vegetation out, it may need further understanding of how you're being

more compatible with your neighbor then. If you're going to leave that vegetation there, and it sounds like without changing the site plan you basically have to. I think that helps your neighbor's situation a lot because that vegetation seems to be very canopy wise, pretty lush from the aerials I've seen. I wanted to make that point because I don't want anybody to assume --

MR. SAINT LOUIS: I love them as well, believe me because I -- I am a French teacher and as well I have degree in modern literature. I like to see them, believe me. And I cherish them. Yeah.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Staff, you have any comments on the clearing issue?

MR. KELLY: Other than I think they will need to do a site development plan and staff will evaluate that it's to code.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. So if they want to clear any of the larger canopy trees on the east side -- on the west side of the site, they would have to come in for a site development plan to do that.

MR. KELLY: It would be part of the site development plan.

MR. BELLOWS: For the development of the church.

MR. KELLY: For the development of the church.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. I just want to make it clear that your -- your decisions that are made in regards to this site plan don't include further clearing of the property that isn't shown on the site plan and that's for a purpose, so, with that I think the trees on the west side are protected and I want to make sure that it stays that way for the applicant. For the neighbor, I mean. I'm sorry.

MR. SAINT LOUIS: Okay.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay.

MR. SAINT LOUIS: Okay.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Thank you.

MR. SAINT LOUIS: Thank you.

THE COURT REPORTER: Sir, before you leave, can I get the name again of the woman in the picture?

MR. SANTIAGO: Oh, yeah, her name is -- I have to spell it for you.

T-G -- T-J-E-U-N-I-E, Saint Louis, like me. S-A-I-N-T, space, L-O-U-I-S.

THE COURT REPORTER: Thank you.

MR. SAINT LOUIS: Okay. Thank you so much.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Thank you. Is there anybody else here that would like to speak on this matter?

(No response.)

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. Do you have any -- the gentleman who represents the applicant for the engineering firm, do you have any comments you'd like to add to the record?

MR. DEAZA: No.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. I think everybody understands the situation and especially on the clearing matter, and with that I'll close the public hearing. A decision will be rendered within 30 days and most likely in about a week to two weeks. Thank you for your time today. Appreciate it.

Okay. Next item up. For those of you that are here for the church, you're more than welcome to leave. Your part is done. You can stay if you want, but I just didn't want you to think you had to sit here all day. So, thank you for driving in. I know it was a long drive for

you.

Next item up is petition number CUD-PL20180000209. The Toll Gate of Naples, LLC. All those wishing to testify on behalf of this item, please rise and be sworn in by the court reporter.

Sir, if you're going to have conversations, you're going to have to take it out in the hall, please. Thank you.

THE COURT REPORTER: Do you swear the testimony you're all about to give will be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth?

(The speakers were duly sworn and indicated in the affirmative.)

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Disclosures on my part. This is the time I chatted with Bob for a minute this morning --

MR. MULHERE: Yes.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: -- and I've also reviewed a couple things with staff. With that, I don't really have any more questions. Are there any members of the public here for this item?

(No response.)

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Well, Bob, that makes your life a little easier.

MR. MULHERE: Yes.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: I don't need -- we don't need a formal presentation. I have read everything. I noticed, and rightfully so, the staff has a recommendation and it is concerning the parking space, the issues. I know you have a parking agreement and I've reviewed it with building seven. So, I'm sure staff will at the time you come in for a permit -- do you have any objection to the staff recommendation?

MR. MULHERE: No, sir. That's fine. We expected to have to do that when we got the zoning certificate anyway, so --

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Okay. I have nothing else, Bob. It's pretty straightforward. It's a comparable compatible so we're good at that point, so --

MR. MULHERE: Thank you.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Thank you. John, do you have any staff report? Well, I know you have a staff report. Do you have any comments? Anything else you'd like to say?

MR. KELLY: With the stipulation noted, staff recommends that you affirm the opinion of the zoning manager that the use of the beauty shop salon SIC 7231, except for beauty and cosmetology schools is comparable and compatible with the parcel A permitted uses contained within Section 3.3.A of the toll gate commercial center PUD.

HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Thank you. Is there any member of the public here wish to speak on this item?

(No response.)


HEARING EXAMINER STRAIN: Hearing none, we'll close the public hearing. A decision will be rendered within 30 days, most likely within a couple of weeks. Thank you very much.

That takes us to the remainder of the agenda which is any other business. I don't have any. Any public comments? No public is here. With that the meeting is adjourned. Thank you.

March 28, 2019 HEX Meeting

There being no further business for the good of the County, the meeting was adjourned by order of the Hearing Examiner at 9:30 a.m.

COLLIER COUNTY HEARING EXAMINER



MARK STRAIN, HEARING EXAMINER

ATTEST
CRYSTAL K. KINZEL, CLERK

These minutes approved by the Hearing Examiner on 4-17-19, as presented by ✓
or as corrected _____.

TRANSCRIPT PREPARED ON BEHALF OF
U.S. LEGAL SUPPORT, INC.
BY DANIELLE AHREN, COURT REPORTER AND NOTARY PUBLIC.