Restoration - Credits and Acres

Total credits from year 2002 to 2008 as proposed by WilsonMiller (W/M now Stantec) to the County in a 197 page report grew from 134,000 credits in 2002 to 315,000 recommended in 2008 to 427,000 including agriculture and panther corridor credits. These numbers were largely accepted by the County at the time. Restoration credits were at 160,000. Early entry bonus credits were 27,000. The W/M totals beyond the 315,000 credits proposed adding credits to a total of 427,000 including 89,000 credits for agriculture and 23,000 for panther corridors. Base credits in the recommendations of 128,000 were derived from partial easements for eliminating a number of layers of environmental benefit out of 7 possible layers. Currently approved easements as of March 2019 for SSA's 1-17 are 70,210 base credits. See chart below for numeric compilations for the W/M numbers and current SSA's 1-17 credit elements.

From the initial 2002 and 2008 recommendations to the present (March 2019) the number of SSA's grew from 13 to 17 with SSA's 14 to 16 approved and SSA 17 still pending. Total restoration credits are currently at 255,109 including Ave Maria. Further growth in SSA derived credits will likely continue.

Restoration credits are currently (March 2019)123,977 are comprised of R-1 "designation" credits approved for SSA's 1-13 38,481 and not yet approved of 20,392 for SSA's 14-17 totaling 58.874. R-1 credits do not require any action except designation. R-2 restoration comprises 64,675 credits for SSA's 1-17. Total restoration credits (R-1 + R-2) represent approximately 50% of total credits.

With regard to restoration **acres**, W/M in 2008 indicated a total of 80,000 potential acres for future restoration. Subsequent to the 2008 recommendations a compilation by Growth Mgt. Div. (year 2011) for R-1 acres of 24,509 and R-2 acres of 23,858 totaling 48,367 acres. See chart below.

Of all the credits discussed R-1 designation had no specified restoration or other purpose defined. Thus no reason for accomplishing anything tangible. Presumably they were established for restoration as the name implies. It is not clear not clear when or by whom nor for what exact purpose were they established. Regardless of derivation there are no time commitments or criteria for accomplishing a goal. To date, after 13 years only 428 acres have been restored (in SSA 6). More on this follows below with proposed policies for restoration planning and execution.

In the context of the massive growth of both total and especially restoration credits and the lack of specified goals for achieving implementation, one policy that is urged immediately is to **Eliminate R-1** credits. Unlike other restoration credits it appears to have no real function.

R-2 credits are defined as "potential" credits for effecting actual restoration. Their implementation however is needs clear definition of specific natural habitats with actionable qualitative and numeric objectives. There needs defined timing to meet ecological functions consisting of starting point, intermediate results, and completions. There is required oversight by 3rd parties other than control by landowners. There is also requirement for stable long term funding sources for both restoration and maintenance. See attached for suggested policy requirements to effect realistic R-2 results.



History of Total Credits to Buildout

History of Restoration Credits to Buildout



Restoration	Credits	&	Acres	by	/ SSA
				_	

	Restora	tion Crea	dits and A	cre	es (R-1 an	d R-2) -	Current	Ma	arch 2019						
souces: Growth Mgt. Div SSA's 1-13 & 4 PL's for SSA's 14-17 2017															
							Res	tora	ation Credit	s SSA's 1-17	- Curren	t March	2019	<u>)</u>	
<u>SSA</u>	R-1 Acres	<u>R-2</u>	(R-1+R-2)		<u>Restorati</u>	<u>Restorati</u>	1								
		<u>Acres</u>	<u>Acres</u>		<u>on</u>	<u>on</u>	300,000) ⊤							
					Designati	Credits	250.000	, ⊥							
					On K-1 Credits	Pending R	,								
1			0.0		<u>creates</u>	<u> </u>	200,000) 			122,	261	Ta	y to l	
2			0.0				150,000	, ⊢					— 10	Judi	
- Adi Tot 38:3A			0.0		/197.8								SS	A's 14-17	
Auj.101 303A			0.0		457.0		100,000) 	58,868	63 <i>,</i> 393			SS S	A's 1-13	
Adi Tot 5&5A	6513		651.3		1 563 1		50,000	, ⊥	_						
6	1 071 5	1 071 5	2 143 0		4 280 4	2 576 (
7	459.0	459	918.0		1.835.9	1.835.9	0) +	R-1 Credits	R-2 Credits	Total C	redits			
9	691.4	691.4	1.382.8		2.765.6	2.765.6			K I CICUIO		Total C	Teuns			
10	13.872.4	13.872.4	27.744.8		13.872.4	13.872.4									
11	1.337.6	1.337.6	2.675.2		2.675.2	5.350.4				Restoration	Acres				
12	4,775.9	4,775.9	9,551.8		4,385.8	8,731.5				SCA'c 1 1	2 Vr 2000				
13	1,649.8	1,649.8	3,299.6		6,599.2	6,599.2				per Growt	<u>.5 11 2009</u> h Møt. Div				
14			0.0		4,945.2	4,945.2		~		<u>per erent</u>		-			
15			0.0		14,178.4	14,178.4	E0,000	Π					48,3	367	
16			0.0		1,269.2	2,538.4	40,000								
17			0.0		0.0	0.0	30,000		24,509		23.858		_		
SSA's 14-17			0				20.000	0+	· · ·				-		
SSA's 1-17					58,868	63,393	10,000	o +					_		
SSA's 14-17					20,393	21,662) c	₀ ↓							
SSA's 1-13	24,509	23,858	48,366.5		38,475	41,731]		R-1 Acres	s	R-2 Acres		Total	Acres	

Current 3/1/2019 Control Source: Growth Mgt. Div SSA's 14 - 17 / 04/2011 Total Credits Total Restoration Total Restoration Credits (B1. H/2.) Interface Ammonder Source: Growth Mgt. Div SSA's 14 - 17 9,906.7 4,356.7 12,657.9 20,392.8 21,662.0 0.0 42,054.8 668,976.1 Source: Growth Mgt. Div. SSA's 1-31 9,906.7 4,356.7 12,657.9 20,392.8 21,662.0 0.0 42,054.8 668,976.1 Source: Growth Mgt. Div. SSA's 1-31 60,303.5 15,195.6 52.7 38,481.4 43,013.5 428.0 81,922.9 157,474.7 Contral SSA's 1-17 9,906.7 4,356.7 12,657.9 20,392.8 21,662.0 0.0 42,054.8 668,976.1 Contral SSA's 1-17 70,210.2 19,552.3 12,710.6 58,874.2 64,675.5 428.0 123,977.7 226,658 Contral SSA's 1-13 60,000.0 Credits Restoration redits % of total credits 498 404 Maria 28,568 28,568 28,568						RLSA - To	tal and Re	storation Cr	edits_			
Source: Growth Mgt. Div SSA's 14-17 from 4 Pt's - 10/6/2017 Total Restoration Total Restoration Total Restoration Image: Control in the stand of the	Current	<u>3/1/2019</u>										
Image: Control of the second	Source:	Growth Mg	t. Div SSA's 14-	17 from 4 PL	<u>s- 10/6/20</u>	<u>)17</u>						
Earned. Earned. (Removing lawers) Earned. Earnet (Removing lawers) Approved (Restora. (Restora. Earnet) E.2.Peterla, Perding. E.2.Peterla, Restora. Pending. Bestora. (Restora. Pending. Combist (H.3.+R.2) (Pending. Including. Pending. Including. Including. <thi< th=""><th></th><th></th><th></th><th>Base Credits</th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th>Total Restoration</th><th>Total Credits</th></thi<>				Base Credits						Total Restoration	Total Credits	
Image: Section of the sectio				Earned -	Approved	Additional	R-1 Restora.	R-2 Potent'l.	Restora.	Credits (R-1 +R-2)	Including Unapprvd	
International Learning Caranya Learning Learning <thlearning< th=""> Learning <thl< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>Easements</td><td>Early Entry</td><td>Base - Not</td><td>Designated -</td><td>Restora</td><td><u>credits</u></td><td>Pending for</td><td>Restora. & Amended</td></thl<></thlearning<>				Easements	Early Entry	Base - Not	Designated -	Restora	<u>credits</u>	Pending for	Restora. & Amended	
Image: Section of the sectio				(Removing	Farned	Approved	Approval	Pending Appvi	<u>completed</u>	Approval	Base	
Source: Growth Mgt. Div. SSA's 1.4-17 9,906.7 4,356.7 12,657.9 20,392.8 21,062.0 0.0 42,058.8 66,976.1 Source: Growth Mgt. Div. SSA's 1.13 Updated 12/8/2011			Tatal ((\ 17	0.000 7	4 25 6 7	12 (57.0	20 202 8	21.002.0	0.0	12.054.0	60.076.1	
Source: Growth Mgt. Div. SSA's 1-13 Updated 12/8/2011 Image: Constraint of the state of			101al SSA S 14-17	9,906.7	4,350.7	12,057.9	20,392.8	21,662.0	0.0	42,054.8	68,976.1	
Source: Growth Mgt. Div. SSA's 1-13 Updated 12/8/2011												
Total SSA's 1-13 60,303.5 15,195.6 52.7 38,481.4 43,013.5 428.0 81,922.9 157,474.7 Total SSA's 14-17 9,906.7 4,356.7 12,657.9 20,392.8 21,662.0 0.0 42,054.8 68,976.1 Total SSA's 14-17 70,210.2 19,552.3 12,710.6 58,874.2 64,675.5 428.0 123,977.7 226,450.8 Restoration credits % of total credits- 49% Ave Maria 28,658 Ave Maria 28,658 Sept. 2008 Total SSA's 1-13 60,000 credits Pather Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, 160,000 Pather Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, Surce: WilsonMiller- Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Pather Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, 160,000 Credits Sa's 1-13 approxt.29% of 40,000 acres proposed restoration of Camp Keais & OK Slough = 11,600 restoration acres. Credits Sa's 1-13 approxt.29% of 40,000 acres proposed restoration of Camp Keais & OK Slough Potential Restoration Credits - (SSA's 10,12,13 54,000 Potential Restoration Credits Z2,000 Credits Z2,000	Source:	Growth Mg	t. Div. SSA's 1-13	Updated 12	/8/2011							
Total SSA's 14-17 9,906.7 4,356.7 12,657.9 20,392.8 21,662.0 0.0 42,054.8 68,976.1 Total SSA's 1-17 70,210.2 19,552.3 12,710.6 58,874.2 64,675.5 428.0 123,977.7 226,450.8 Restoration credits % of total credits = 49% Ave Maria 28,658 Ave Maria 28,658 Sept. 2008 Total Current Credits 255,109 Development Acres @ 8 creds. /acre 28,306 Acres of Compact Development Sept. 2008 Savis 1-13 Aapyod. & Pending 82,000 credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, Flow Way 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, +Fl			Total SSA's 1-13	60,303.5	15,195.6	52.7	38,481.4	43,013.5	428.0	81,922.9	157,474.7	
Total SSA's 14-17 9,906.7 4,356.7 12,657.9 20,392.8 21,662.0 0.0 42,054.8 68,976.1 Total SSA's 1-17 70,210.2 19,552.3 12,710.6 58,874.2 64,675.5 428.0 123,977.7 226,450.8 Restoration credits % of total credits 49% Ave Maria 28,658 Ave Maria 28,658 Sept. 2008 Image: Source: WilsonMiller- Proposed RLSA Modificatiins - Report to Wm. Greenwood Development Acres @ 8 creds. /acre 28,306 Acres of Compact Development Source: WilsonMiller- Proposed RLSA Modificatiins - Report to Wm. Greenwood Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: WilsonMiller- Proposed RLSA Modificatiins - Report to Wm. Greenwood Image: Source 28,306 Acres of Compact Development Acres @ 8 creds. /acre Source: WilsonMiller- Proposed RLSA Modificatiins - Report to Wm. Greenwood Image: Source 28,306 Acres of Compact Development Credits 28,306 SSA's 1-13 Appvd. & Pending 82,000 credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, Image: Source Image: Source Image: Source <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>,</td><td>,</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>,</td><td></td></td<>				,	,					,		
Image: Second		-	Fotal SSA's 14-17	9,906.7	4,356.7	12,657.9	20,392.8	21,662.0	0.0	42,054.8	68,976.1	
Total SSA's 1-17 70,210.2 19,552.3 12,710.6 58,874.2 64,675.5 428.0 123,977.7 226,450.8 Image: Start Star												
Restoration credits % of total credits 49% Ave Maria 28,658 Ave Maria 28,658 Development Acres @ 8 creds./acre 28,306 Sept. 2008 Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: WilsonMiller- Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: WilsonMiller - Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: WilsonMiller - Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: WilsonMiller - Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: WilsonMiller - Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: Future restoration 78,000 reedits Future restoration 160,000 credits 22k Sa's 1-13 approxt. 29% of 40,000 acres proposed restoration of Camp Keais & OK Slough = 11,600 restoration acres. Credits g. 192 Aproved Restoration Credits - (SSA's 1.9, 11) 28,000 Potential Restoration Acres pg. 192 Estmated Future Restoration Credits 72,000 Incl. Camp Keais & OK Slough Credits			Total SSA's 1-17	70,210.2	19,552.3	12,710.6	58,874.2	64,675.5	428.0	123,977.7	226,450.8	
international internatinterational international international intern							Restoration	credits % of to	tal credits=	49%		
Sept. 2008 Image: Se										Ave Maria	28,658	
Sept. 2008 Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: WilsonMiller - Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure g. 192 SSA's 1-13 Aapprok. & Pending 82,000 credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracra 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, g. 192 SSA's 1-13 Aapprok. 200 credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracra 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, start Total Restoration 160,000 credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracra 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, sSa's 1-13 approx. 29% of 40,000 credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracra 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, sSa's 1-13 approx. 29% of 40,000 credits Floway 16.5k, + Native Habitat Restora. 22k g. 192 Approved Restoration Credits - (SSA's 1.9, 11) 28,000 pending Restoration Credits - (SSA's 1.9, 11) 28,000 pending Restoration Credits - (SSA's 1.9, 11) 28,000 pending Restoration Credits - (SSA's 1.9, 12,13 54,000 penential Restoration Cre									Total	Current Credits	255,109	
Sept. 2008 Image: Comparison of Comparison									Developme	ent Acres @ 8 cred	s. /acre	
Sept. 2005 Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: WilsonMiller- Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Plus 10% - 30% for infrastructure Source: WilsonMiller- Proposed RLSA Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, Pg. 192 SA's 1-13 Aappvd. & Pending Future restoration 82,000 78,000 credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, Sa's 1-13 approxt. 29% of 40,000 acres proposed restoration of Camp Keals & OK Slough = 11,600 restoration acres. Credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, Pg. 192 Approved Restoration Credits - (SSA's 1-9, 11) Z8,000 Credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control acres. Pg. 192 Approved Restoration Credits - (SSA's 10,12,13) S4,000 Credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 10, Credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control acres. Pg. 192 Estmated Future Restoration Credits - (SSA's 10,12,13) Credits QL,000 Pather Habitat 6k, +Caracara 10k, +Exotic Control acres. Pather Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control acres. Pg. 192 Estmated Future Restoration Credits - (SSA's 10,12,13) 16,000 Incl. Camp Keals & OK Slough Incl. Camp Keals & OK Slough Path									28,306	Acres of Compact	Development	
Source: WilsonMiller- Proposed RLS- Modifications - Report to Wm. Greenwood Mode Mode pg. 192 SSA's 1-13 Aappvd. & Pending 82,000 credits Panther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, Flow W	Sept. 20	<u>008</u>	Plus 10% - 30% for infrastruct									
pg. 192SSA's 1-13 Appvd. & Pending82,000creditsPanther Habitat 6k, +Caracara 11k, +Exotic Control 16.5k, +Flow Way 16.5k, + Floway 16.5k, +Native Habitat Restora. 22kInternation 160,000160,000creditsInternation 160,000Internation 160,00	Source:	WilsonMill	er- Proposed RLS	A Modificat	tiins - Repor	t to Wm. Gr	eenwood					
Image: Note: Future restoration78,000+ Floway 16.5k + Native Habitat Restora. 22kImage: Note:	pg. 192	SSA's 1-13 A	appvd. & Pending	82,000	credits	Panther Hat	oitat 6k, +Car	acara 11k, +Ex	otic Control	16.5k, +Flow Way	16.5k,	
Image: Note that the storation of the st			Future restoration	<u>78,000</u>		+ Floway 16	5.5k + Native	Habitat Resto	ra. 22k			
SSa's 1-13 =proxt. 29% of 40,000 acres proposed restoration of Camp Keals & OK Slough = 11,600 restoration acres. Image: Credits in the constraint of Camp Keals & OK Slough = 11,600 restoration acres. pg. 192 Approved Restoration Credits - (SSA's 1-9, 11) 28,000 Image: Credits in the constraint of Camp Keals & OK Slough in the constra		Т	otal Restoration	160,000	credits							
no.n		SSa's 1-13 a	pproxt. 29% of 40,00	00 acres propo	osed restoration	on of Camp Ke	eais & OK Slou	ugh = 11,600 res	toration acres	5.		
pg. 192 Approved Restoration Credits - (SSA's 1-9, 11) 28,000 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>Credits</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>						Credits						
Pending Restoration Credits - (SSA's 10,12,13 54,000 Image: Comparison of the comparison of th	pg. 192	Approved Re	estoration Credits	- (SSA's 1-9,	11)	28,000						
pg. 192 Estmated Future Restoration Credits 72,000 Incl. Camp K=ais & OK Slouth Incl. Camp K=ais & OK Slouth Potential Restoration Credits for Urent System 160,000 Potential Restoration Acres Acres pg. 192 Base Credits Image: Credi		Pending Res	toration Credits -	(SSA's 10,12	,13	54,000						
Potential Restoration Credits for Current System 160,000 Potential Central Restoration Acres Acres Potential Credits Image: Contral Central Cent	pg. 192	Estmated Fu	ture Restoration 0	Credits		72,000	Incl. Camp K	eais & OK Slou	ıgh			
Potential Credits Image: Credits Potential Restoration Acres Acres pg. 192 Base Credits 128,000 Planned Restoration SSA' 1-13 12,000 Image: Credits Restoration Credits 160,000 Future Credits @ 4 credits/acre 40,000 Image: Credits Early Entry Bonus Image: Credits 160,000 Potential Acres 52,000 Image: Credits Image: Credits Image: Credits Image: Credits 160,000 Image: Credits 60,000 Image: Credits Image: Credits Image: Credits Image: Credits 160,000 Image: Credits 160,000 Image: Credits Image: Credits </td <td></td> <td>Pote</td> <td>ntial Restoration C</td> <td>credits for Cu</td> <td>rrent System</td> <td>160,000</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>		Pote	ntial Restoration C	credits for Cu	rrent System	160,000						
pg. 192 Base Credits Base Credits 128,000 Planned Restoration SSA' 1-13 12,000 Restoration Credits 160,000 Early Entry Bonus 160,000 Carly Entry Bon		Potential Cr	edits						<u>Potential</u>	Restoration Acres	Acres	
Restoration Credits 160,000 Future Credits @ 4 credits/acre 40,000 Early Entry Bonus 27,000 Potential Acres To Be Restored 52,000 Total Proposed Credits 315,000 Image: Credits Image: Credits ng. 192 Agriculture Credits 280,000 Agriculture Credits Credits	pg. 192		Base Credits			128,000		F	Planned Res	toration SSA' 1-13	12,000	
Early Entry Bonus 27,000 Potential Acres To Be Restored 52,000 Total Proposed Credits 315,000			Restoration Credi	ts		160,000		Fu	ture Credits	s @ 4 credits/acre	40,000	
Total Proposed Credits 315,000 and and and and and and and and and and			Early Entry Bonus			<u>27,000</u>		Potent	ial Acres	To Be Restored	52,000	
ng 102 Agriculturo Crodite 90,000 Agriculturo Crodite Crodite			То	tal Propos	ed Credits	315,000						
ng 102 Agriculture Credite 90,000 Agriculture Credite Credite												
pg. 155 Agriculture creaits 65,000 Agriculture creaits Creaits	pg. 193		Agriculture Credit	S		89,000		Agriculture Cr	edits_		<u>Credits</u>	
Open Designated - Not Already in SSA's 39,000								Open Desi	gnated - No	t Already in SSA's	39,000	
pg. 193 Panther Corridor Credits 23,000 Privately ly Owned Open Designated - Outside ACSC 50,000	pg. 193		Panther Corridor (Credits		23,000	Privately	ly Owned Ope	n Designate	ed - Outside ACSC	<u>50,000</u>	
l otal Credits 427,000 89,000				To	tal Credits	427,000					89,000	
	N 07	0.2										
Year ZUUZ Image: State of the Colling County Dury Ling A A and the Count	Year 20	<u>UZ</u>	December 1.11			und to the			C	fan tha Ingila	Anna Churk "	
Page 40 Report and Recommendations of the Collier County Rural Lands Assessment Area Oversight Committee for the Immokalee Area Study"	Page 40	Report and	Recommendation	is of the Coll	her County R	urai Lands A	ssessment A	area Oversight	committee	for the immokalee	Area Study"	
County staff halioved this program had a maximum amount of notantial development limited to approve 10,000 series of CDAs		County ct-f	y wiisoniviilier, iv	agram had		amount of .	atontial da	volonmont !!~	ited to cm		of CRAs	
Based on 8 Credits/acre – 134 400 Credits		county stal	Raso	d on 8 Cree	lits/acre -	134 400		velopment im	nteu to app	107. 10,000 deres	UI JNAS	

The following narrative and policy recommendations suggest needed input to clearly plan and define restoration results based on requirements for each desired habitat and unit demarcated. It discusses credit distribution and release within designated units of restoration. It includes 8 key elements which should, after staff review and BCC review be eventually incorporated in the LDC.

Following this there is a detailed critique of SSA 15's current restoration plan based on input from a highly experienced ecologist as an example of problems which could arise with the present system.

<u>Guide for Policy Recommendations</u> <u>Restoration Planning and Execution</u>

Plan requirements

- 1) While it is understood that credit has already been provided to the landowner for restrictive easement on the property, prior to approving any additional credit releases. A fully restrictive perpetual easement should be required. Restoration areas are placed under perpetual conservation easement specifically for the purpose of habitat/restoration as identified in County approved restoration plans and clearly prohibiting activities contrary to that purpose such as fill, excavation, cutting/harvest of native trees, use of lands for certain types of agriculture, road/structure building (unless identified in the approved restoration plan), and exploration/extraction of oil/minerals.
- 2) The current restoration plan is extremely vague in both details of target restoration by each restoration unit of activity (farm field size, road length, floway measures) and associated measurable success goals: This should be deemed unacceptable as it will make it impossible to agree upon if restorations activities are done correctly and whether they are trending in a positive direction. It is suggested that each separate restoration unit be defined by owner in the restoration plan. Then for each unit's acreage the owner provides pre and post determinations by specific habitat type with supporting information describing pre and anticipated post conditions.
- 3) The restoration plan (SSA 15) provides for two years of natural recruitment prior to potential planting. This seems problematic especially within a large field that has been actively farmed for many years and thus has no appropriate native seed bank to establish an appropriate natural vegetative community. This is likely to result in extended time to meet basic success goals and will likely result in greater coverage of exotic and nuisance species in the initial years after restoration, thus increasing restoration cost and risk.
- 4) The plan only identifies that the owner will control Category I and Category II exotic species, but nuisance species such as cattail, dog fennel, and pasture grasses might be allowed to flourish and be inadvertently be counted towards successful vegetation establishment.
- 5) The restoration plan should provide clearly defined success criteria goals by habitat including desired dominate native species and minimum appropriate vegetative cover by habitat (deep marsh, marsh, wet prairie, hydric pine flatwoods, hardwood wetlands, cypress, pine uplands, palmetto uplands, etc). For each of these systems targeted habitats hydroperiods (time period of saturation/inundation, average season high water depth, maximum seasonal high water) needs to be defined to allow post assessment and management adjustments. For forested and upland systems in addition to identifying appropriate native tree composition (species and dominance) minimum trees per acre and minimum tree height/canopy closure will define level of success.

- 6) The agreement must clearly indicate who is responsible for conducting/funding restoration activities and monitoring, including anticipated cost and schedule for restoration activities. Additionally, prior to credit release, financial assurance through an instrument such as a bond should be established. This will provide reasonable assurance that the work will be successfully carried out. The required financial instrument could then be reduced periodically as clearly defined restoration goals/success targets are met
- 7) Agreed upon approved credits should be released incrementally based on attainment of reasonable levels of success of the restoration activities. Sufficient credits should be withheld until intermediate and final success criteria are met. A long-term maintenance fund as suggested below should be established so that there is incentive for the owners to successfully complete the restoration.
- 8) The plan should clearly identify a long-term term management entity who will maintain restored lands after attaining restoration success and release of credits. Insuring funding for long-term management is essential. A suggested approach would be for each credit received, the owner would set aside monies into a long-term management endowment fund. Such a fund would be solely used for long term management of the property. This applies only after all phases meet substantial success. Funding should be sufficient so that at the time of final success a conservative projected interest rate will support the fund's maintenance.

Crtique of Restoration plan for SSA15 Including Distribution of Credit Allotments

- 10,426 credits (73.5%) allocated for flow-way restoration (removal of roads)
- 3,658 credits (25.6%) allocated for farm field restoration (grading/natural habitat establishment)
- 94.4 credits (0.9%) allocated for the Habitat Enhancement areas (Exotic Control)

Problem 1: It appears that an error was made on assignment of credits for flow-way work and farm field work. The amount of restoration work/expense for the restoration of farm fields and the potential regional wetland/flow-way/wildlife benefits for the farm field restoration is an order of magnitude greater than the cost/benefits associated with the road removal (flow-way restoration). The credits allotted should more justifiably be assigned with the 70% percent to the farm fields and ±25% for the road removal.

Problem 2: Within the discussion on credit distribution the roads are separate from the farm field restoration. However, in the description of activities it is clear that the restoration of the flow way pinch point requires that the farm road and farm fields 8, 9 & 10 be regraded to alleviate pinch point. So, in order to obtain any credits for the flow way restoration, at least these farm fields must be successfully regraded.

Problem 3: There are no success criteria in the plan, only restoration goals: There needs to be clearly defined and measurable expectations on what defines successful fulfillment of the restoration goals (criteria) which are reasonable and progressive in nature.

The plan states number of credits for each activity and that success will be met but it is not clear on when credits are available. As all activities and achievement of full success attainment are likely to take multiple years, it is recommended that the credits are released progressively after achieving/measurable project thresholds – with enough credits withheld until final success to maintain incentive to successfully complete project: An example of such a graduated release of credit would be as follows:

- 1. Flow-way restoration
 - a. Place restoration area under perpetual conservation easement 15% credit release
 - b. Completion of grading/as build surveys 20% credit release
 - c. Attainment of minimum 20% appropriate native vegetation < 10% exotic/nuisance vegetations 20% credit release
 - d. Attainment of 80% cover appropriate native vegetation and <5% exotic/nuisance vegetation after 1 year w/out maintenance 25% credit release
 - e. Transfer to maintenance entity/long term funding 20% release
- 2. Farm field restoration
 - a. Place restoration area under perpetual conservation easement 15% credit release
 - b. Completion of grading/disking/herbicide provide build surveys 20% credit release
 - c. Attainment of minimum 20% appropriate native vegetation < 10% exotic/nuisance vegetations 20% credit release
 - d. Attainment of 80% cover appropriate native vegetation and <5% exotic/nuisance vegetation after one-year w/out maintenance 25% credit release
 - e. Transfer to maintenance entity/long term funding 20% credit release
- 3. Habitat Enhancement (Exotic Vegetation Removal)
 - a. Place restoration area under perpetual conservation easement 15% release
 - b. Completion of initial exotic control 20% release
 - c. Following one year of maintenance treatments (two maintenance treatments) and annual report: 20% credit
 - d. Attainment of 80% cover appropriate native vegetation and <5% exotic/nuisance vegetation 25% credit release
 - e. Transfer to maintenance entity/long term funding 20% release

Timing of the Restoration Work: The current plan has table(3) listing different activities but does not provide any relative information on anticipated dates, or anticipated time frame start to finish for any of the projects. Are they all going to be start in the first year? Or are individual phases anticipated to begin over a period of 5 or 10 years? How long are individual work phases anticipated to take to reach different phases of success Time-Zero, confirmation of native vegetation establishment/exotic control, and attainment of appropriate native vegetation cover and less than 5% exotic vegetation cover?

The plan is very vague on actual success goals and specific anticipated restoration plans for habitat establishment (ie vegetation/hydrology by designed habitat type) - this should be more specific in order to assess achievement of habitat goals. Also, conversion of large areas which have previously been converted and heavily managed for agriculture use to native habitats through a dependence on native seed bank recruitment is very risky (estimate <10% chance of success within in 5 years) – fatal flaw in the plans and anticipated to significantly increase time of success obtainment and cost to reach final goals.