

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

**Recommendation to approve the short list of design professionals pursuant to RFP No. 14-6228, “Collier County Beach Renourishment 15-year Permit,” and authorize staff to negotiate contracts with the top ranked firm for subsequent Board approval and make a finding that this item promotes tourism.**

---

**OBJECTIVE:** To retain professional engineering services to obtain a new 15-year multi use beach renourishment permit for future Collier County renourishment projects.

**CONSIDERATIONS:** The existing 10-year beach renourishment permit will expire on 1/12/2015 and a new permit is required to perform future beach renourishment projects. Collier County is desirous to permit a comprehensive renourishment program for its beaches under the new FDEP 15-year permit rules. The permit application will adhere to essentially the same project built in 2005-06 and planned for 2013, which will simplify permit processing. The project area extends along the Gulf Coast in Collier County, FL between FDEP monuments R-22 to R-79.

The purpose of this scope of work is to secure a 15-year multi-use permit in order to perform routine or emergency nourishment along Collier County beaches. The permit will allow for Collier County to be ready for an emergency response to a major storm event with approved sand sources. Borrow Area T1 will be re-permitted for use as an offshore sand source. The permit will include the use of upland sand sources to supplement or substitute for an offshore sand source. The template will be a composite of the 2005/06 and 2013/14 design. The project will be designed with a 6 to 10-year project life, but will accommodate sea level rise during the project life. The permit application will request approval for two major nourishments from offshore sand sources supplemented by truck haul projects. In addition, multiple truck haul projects, every couple of years, using upland sand sources, will be requested as a substitute for dredging from offshore sand sources. The aim is to provide the County flexibility to change with the dredging market and needs of the County.

A Request for Proposal (RFP) was solicited in order for the project’s design to be in compliance with the applicable Consultants’ Competitive Negotiations Act (CCNA) requirements. On February 18, 2014 RFP No. 14-6228, “Collier County Beach Renourishment 15-year Permit,” was posted. One thousand one hundred and eighty five (1,185) notices were sent out and forty five (45) firms downloaded full document packages. Two (2) responsive proposals were received on March 14, 2014. On March 27, 2014, a selection committee short-listed the two (2) firms based on an evaluation of their technical proposals. The selection committee was represented by a member from the Pelican Bay Services Division, the City of Naples, the County Engineer, the Facilities Department and Coastal Zone Management. The selection committee by consensus (5-0) ranked the firms as shown below:

<b>Name of Firm</b>	<b>Final Ranking</b>
Coastal Planning and Engineering (CPE)	1
Humiston and Moore (H&M)	2

The top firm, CPE is very familiar with the scope of this project having just completed the recent truck haul project. CPE has extensive experience the state and federal permitting. Staff recommends approval of the final ranking and requests authorization to commence contract negotiations with CPE for this work. If contract negotiations are not successful with CPE, then staff is seeking authorization to commence contract negotiations with H&M with the objective of bringing an acceptable negotiated contract back to the Board for approval.

**FISCAL IMPACT:** There is no fiscal impact at this time. Funding is available through Tourist Development Tax, Fund 195. A Budget Amendment will be required to transfer funds from Fund 195 reserves to perform this work.

**GROWTH MANAGEMENT IMPACT:** There are no Growth Management Impacts as a result of this project at this time.

**ADVISORY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS:** At the April 10, 2014 CAC meeting this item was unanimously approved by a 9 to 0 vote.

**LEGAL CONSIDERATIONS:** This item has been approved as to form and legality and requires majority vote for approval. – CMG

**RECOMMENDATION:** To approve the short list of design professionals pursuant to RFP No. 14-6228, “Collier County Beach Renourishment 15-year Permit,” and authorize staff to negotiate contracts with the top ranked firm for subsequent Board approval and make a finding that this item promotes tourism.

Prepared by: J. Gary McAlpin, PE Coastal Zone Management Manager of the Natural Resources Department

Attachments: (1) Request for Proposal; and (2) Final Ranking



### Selection Committee Final Ranking Sheet

RFP #: 14-6228

Title: Collier County Beach Renourishment 15 Year Permit

Name of Firm	Mike Bauer	Margaret Bishop	Gary McAlpin	Jack McKenna	Scott Streckenbein	Average	Final Rank
CB&I Coastal Planning & Engineering	1	1	1	1	1	1	1.0000
Humiston and Moore Engineers	2	2	2	2	2	2	2.0000

Purchasing Representative

Adam Northrup 03/27/2014

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Adam Northrup", written over a rectangular box that contains the typed name and date.

**Collier County Purchasing Department  
 Individual Selection Committee Working Paper**

**RFP #: 14-6228**

**Title: Collier County Beach Renourishment 15 Year Permit**

**Step 1:** Selection committee members individually assigns points for each criterion listed below on their working paper.

Name	Tab II Firm Credentials and Experience (25 Points)	Tab III Business Plan (25 Points)	Tab IV Discipline Experience (30 Points)	Tab V References (20 Points)	Total (Criteria points should be added together)	Rank Order (after Selection Committee discussion)
CB&I Coastal Planning & Engineering	25	25	30	19.92	99.92	1
Humiston and Moore Engineers	20	20	25	20	85	2

TOTAL

**Step 2:** Final Individual Selection Committee Member Rank Order: The individual selection committee member should review the individual vendor total scores above (highest scores being the best to lowest). Rank order each of the vendors from 1 (the highest number of points), 2 is the next highest and so forth based on information obtained from proposals, recommendations, County evaluations and any other information discussed in the public meeting(s).

I have identified my individual criteria scoring (and Total), and rank order for the firms who have submitted proposals for this solicitation. Sign and date the form below.

Signature

Mark R. Bower

3/27/2014

**Collier County Purchasing Department  
 Individual Selection Committee Working Paper**

**RFP #: 14-6228**

**Title: Collier County Beach Renourishment 15 Year Permit**

**Step 1:** Selection committee members individually assigns points for each criterion listed below on their working paper.

Name	Tab II Firm Credentials and Experience (25 Points)	Tab III Business Plan (25 Points)	Tab IV Discipline Experience (30 Points)	Tab V References (20 Points)	Total (Criteria points should be added together)	Rank Order (after Selection Committee discussion)
CB&I Coastal Planning & Engineering	25	24	29	20	19.92	1
Humiston and Moore Engineers	24	23	28	20	75	2
TOTAL						

**Step 2:** Final Individual Selection Committee Member Rank Order: The individual selection committee member should review the individual vendor total scores above (highest scores being the best to lowest). Rank order each of the vendors from 1 (the highest number of points), 2 is the next highest and so forth based on information obtained from proposals, recommendations, County evaluations and any other information discussed in the public meeting(s).

I have identified my individual criteria scoring (and Total), and rank order for the firms who have submitted proposals for this solicitation. Sign and date the form below.

Signature

  
 3-27-14

**Collier County Purchasing Department  
 Individual Selection Committee Working Paper**

**RFP #: 14-6228**

**Title: Collier County Beach Renourishment 15 Year Permit**

**Step 1:** Selection committee members individually assigns points for each criterion listed below on their working paper.

Name	Tab II Firm Credentials and Experience (25 Points)	Tab III Business Plan (25 Points)	Tab IV Discipline Experience (30 Points)	Tab V References (20 Points)	Total (Criteria points should be added together)	Rank Order (after Selection Committee discussion)
CB&I Coastal Planning & Engineering	25	25	30	19.92	99.92	1
Humiston and Moore Engineers	20	20	25	20	85.00	2
TOTAL						

**Step 2:** Final Individual Selection Committee Member Rank Order: The individual selection committee member should review the individual vendor total scores above (highest scores being the best to lowest). Rank order each of the vendors from 1 (the highest number of points), 2 is the next highest and so forth based on information obtained from proposals, recommendations, County evaluations and any other information discussed in the public meeting(s).

I have identified my individual criteria scoring (and Total), and rank order for the firms who have submitted proposals for this solicitation. Sign and date the form below.

Signature

J. Gary McAlpin  
 3/27/2014

① all inhouse, experience, knowledge  
 Staff resources THA never done  
 CBI - Resources -  
 More staff

**Collier County Purchasing Department  
 Individual Selection Committee Working Paper**

**RFP #: 14-6228**

**Title: Collier County Beach Renourishment 15 Year Permit**

**Step 1:** Selection committee members individually assigns points for each criterion listed below on their working paper.

Name	Tab II Firm Credentials and Experience (25 Points)	Tab III Business Plan (25 Points)	Tab IV Discipline Experience (30 Points)	Tab V References (20 Points)	Total (Criteria points should be added together)	Rank Order (after Selection Committee discussion)
CB&I Coastal Planning & Engineering	25	23	<del>25</del> 30	19.92	97.92	1
Humiston and Moore Engineers	23	25	23 23	20	96	2
TOTAL						

**Step 2:** Final Individual Selection Committee Member Rank Order: The individual selection committee member should review the individual vendor total scores above (highest scores being the best to lowest). Rank order each of the vendors from 1 (the highest number of points), 2 is the next highest and so forth based on information obtained from proposals, recommendations, County evaluations and any other information discussed in the public meeting(s).

I have identified my individual criteria scoring (and Total), and rank order for the firms who have submitted proposals for this solicitation. Sign and date the form below.

Signature

 3/27/14

**Collier County Purchasing Department  
 Individual Selection Committee Working Paper**

RFP #: 14-6228

Title: Collier County Beach Renourishment 15 Year Permit

Step 1: Selection committee members individually assigns points for each criterion listed below on their working paper.

Name	Tab II Firm Credentials and Experience (25 Points)	Tab III Business Plan (25 Points)	Tab IV Discipline Experience (30 Points)	Tab V References (20 Points)	Total (Criteria points should be added together)	Rank Order (after Selection Committee discussion)
CB&I Coastal Planning & Engineering	25	25	30	19.92	99.92	1
Humiston and Moore Engineers	24	24	29	20	97	2

TOTAL

Step 2: Final Individual Selection Committee Member Rank Order: The individual selection committee member should review the individual vendor total scores above (highest scores being the best to lowest). Rank order each of the vendors from 1 (the highest number of points), 2 is the next highest and so forth based on information obtained from proposals, recommendations, County evaluations and any other information discussed in the public meeting(s).

I have identified my individual criteria scoring (and Total), and rank order for the firms who have submitted proposals for this solicitation. Sign and date the form below.

Signature



3/27/14

## **Request for Proposal**

### **15-year Multi-Use Joint Coastal Permit for Collier County Beach Renourishment**

The Board of County Commissioners of Collier County is seeking qualified firms capable of providing engineering services as required to obtain a 15-year multi-use Joint Coastal Permit (JCP) for Collier County's beach renourishment program. The existing 10-year renourishment permit will expire on 1/12/2015 and the County is desirous of having a new permit in place at that time.

#### **The following items are to be included in this permit application and scope of work:**

Collier County is desirous to permit a comprehensive renourishment program for its beaches under the new FDEP 15-year permit rules. The permit application will adhere to essentially the same project built in 2005-06 and planned for 2013, which will simplify permit processing. The project area extends along the Gulf Coast in Collier County, FL between FDEP monuments R-22 to R-79.

The purpose of this scope of work is to secure a 15-year multi-use permit in order to perform routine or emergency nourishment along Collier County beaches. The permit will allow for Collier County to be ready for an emergency response to a major storm event with approved sand sources. Borrow Area T1 will be re-permitted for use as an offshore sand source. The permit will include the use of upland sand sources to supplement or substitute for an offshore sand source. The template will be a composite of the 2005/06 and 2013/14 design. The project will be designed with a 6 to 10-year project life, but will accommodate sea level rise during the project life. The permit application will request approval for two major nourishments from offshore sand sources supplemented by truck haul projects. In addition, multiple truck haul projects, every couple of years, using upland sand sources, will be requested as a substitute for dredging from offshore sand sources. The aim is to provide the County flexibility to change with the dredging market and needs of the County.

The major differences between this permit applications compared to previous permits are as follows:

#### **Beach management flexibility**

Permitting three types of projects – routine maintenance, major post-storm restoration, and emergency hot spot nourishment using both offshore sand source and truck haul from an upland sand source.

- Emergency truck haul will be permitted to allow for quick sand placement above and below mean high water during an emergency situation.
- Permit three (3) upland sand sources and Doctors Pass as a sand source to supplement the offshore sand source.

#### **Sea level rise incorporated into the design**

- This will allow for a progressively higher beach and dune template to help combat rising sea level.

#### **Longer design life**

- The current design life is variable, which will be changed to a design life of between 6 to 10 years to allow for beach management flexibility and economy.

### Longer permit length of 15 years

- The FDEP permit length will allow fifteen (15) years or two beach nourishment events. If the permittee is unable to complete two events within 15 years, they may request an extension.
- Request that the Corps accommodate this rule in their permitted length.

### Expedited permitting process if feasible

- Reduce the time and cost for securing a new permit.
- The FDEP project criteria for expediting the project is: Beach nourishment projects that are constructed and maintained with no substantial changes in project scope, and past performance indicates the project has met design expectations are eligible for a simplified and expedited permitting process.
- The Corps stated that the permit processing would be straight forward as long as there were no major policy changes in such things as critical habitat, endangered species, or in basic conditions for their treatment.
- An application for a new BOEM license will not be part of the scope of work.
- The entire 2006 and 2013 fill lengths will be permitted, with the option of including gaps where no nourishment is required.

## Joint Coastal Permit Application

### 1. Prepare Joint Coastal Permit Application

- State and Federal permits and approvals will be required to implement future beach renourishment before the existing permit expires. Every effort should be made to seek and secure a 15-year permit. Evaluation and incorporation of existing and recently acquired design, geotechnical, and environmental documentation into a Florida Department of Environmental Protection (FDEP) Joint Coastal Permit (JCP) application package that presents the information in the approved agency format. New or additional field investigations or studies should be minimized and avoided. In addition to descriptive information, the permit application should include the appropriate sketches and drawings to graphically describe the project. The consultant will provide the draft JCP package to Collier County for review and comment. Electronic copies (Adobe Acrobat PDF format on CD-Rom) of the JCP application will be prepared and submitted to the FDEP for distribution and review. One (1) hard and electronic copy of the permit application will be submitted to the appropriate U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) representative responsible for project review and comment. Electronic copies will be provided to other agencies as needed. The permit application will incorporate the results of the 2013 nourishment project.
- The permit documents will include information pertinent to beach erosion, beach performance, environmental setting, design details in permit drawings, sand source criteria, and any other information deemed important by State and Federal agencies. The permit will also incorporate information developed in recently completed geotechnical investigations, engineering studies, and physical monitoring reports.

### 2. Administration

- Administration includes coordination, meetings, progress and status updates, budget control, scheduling, planning, internal meetings, and other associated management tasks.

### 3. Pre-Application Meeting

- Coordinate with the County and State and Federal resource protection agencies to schedule a project pre-application meeting. Schedule the pre-application meeting sufficiently in advance to allow those State and Federal agencies responsible for project evaluation to attend. Agencies that will be invited include the FDEP, USACE, National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS), United States Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS), and Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation Commission (FWC). The purpose of the meeting will be to describe the design decisions that the County reached in formulating the proposed project. Goals of the pre-application meeting are to obtain agency input on the proposal, identify additional data needs and concerns, and develop responses to those issues before submittal of the JCP. By meeting with the agencies before formal submittal of the JCP, the critical tasks will be identify and criteria needed to process a 15-year permit. The FDEP has new rules for repeating nourishment projects that will reduce the amount of effort required, but they have not been finalized nor formally accepted by the USACE. One trip to Tallahassee with County staff to meet and coordinate with the agencies should be included in this proposal. Consultation with the Corps of Engineers (USACE) in Ft. Myers must occur to fully investigate criteria for an expedited permit process and a 15-year permit length, and how the Corps process can be integrated into the new FDEP procedures. Recommendations to the County based on the results of these meetings are required.

### 4. Prepare Engineering Sections

- Prepare an updated engineering summary of the project area that will supplement previously submitted engineering reports. This summary will analyze recent trends and contain an updated sediment budget for the area. Update the design based upon previous design templates and maximize the design life where feasible. The design will account for historic volumetric and MHW change rates. The design will propose a progressively higher beach and dune design template in order to account for future sea level rise. Dune restoration and planting will also be included within the plan. This design methodology will be documented within the engineering summary for use in permitting.
- Along with the engineering summary, prepare a project and construction description, project schedule, impact analysis, and other required engineering documents and drawings for the permit application. Permit sketches will be developed and finalized within this phase. The permit sketches will include a plan-view design with corresponding beach profile cross-sections along with borrow area design.
- Results of the previous engineering, inlet and monitoring reports will be incorporated into the permit application.

### 5. Expedited Handling

- The engineering report and attachments will make a case for an expedited FDEP permitting process. The criteria that beach nourishment projects that are constructed and maintained with no substantial changes in project scope, and past performance indicates the project has met design expectations will be used for a simplified and expedited permitting process under the following criteria:
  - i. Beach nourishment has been conducted at least once since the initial construction of the beach restoration;
  - ii. Physical and biological site conditions have not changed since initial construction of the project that would result in a violation of water quality standards or a significant adverse impact to the coastal system;

- iii. Physical monitoring data and analysis has shown the project has performed according to design expectations;
- iv. The project has met performance expectations, with due regard for storm impacts, by maintaining the beach restoration project through the design nourishment interval;
- v. The advance nourishment fill volume is not greater than the design volume used in the preceding maintenance events after an allowance for incidental erosion of the design profile (backshore berm);
- vi. Biological monitoring data and analysis has shown no additional adverse impacts greater than those anticipated by the original permitted project;
- vii. For the item f above, an analysis of actions at Blind Pass will address how they met FDEP Strategic Management Plan and Interlocal agreement criteria.
- viii. The applicant has conducted and submitted to the Department all the physical and biological monitoring data and analysis required by permits for the preceding project.

6. Prepare Environmental Sections

- Biologists will review and compile updated environmental data (e.g. sea turtle nesting data, shorebird nesting, and hardbottom resources) that may be requested by FDEP and/or USACE. This will include pre-construction hardbottom biological monitoring data collected in August 2013 before the 2013 beach renourishment project. Coordinate with various agencies to obtain any additional data. No new field work should be required.
- Environmental sections of the JCP application, including threatened and endangered species present, existing natural communities, wildlife surveys, biological resources, etc., will be prepared by a qualified biologist. Biologists will also provide additional information for the USACE which may be required for consultation with USFWS and NMFS, such as the Manatee Biological Evaluation (USFWS) and the Section 7 Consultation Checklist (NMFS). Assist the USACE in preparing a public notice, consultation letter and advertising the public notice.
- Based upon recent guidance, it is anticipated that the environmental information submitted with the JCP application and within the Manatee Biological Evaluation (USFWS) and Section 7 Consultation Checklist (NMFS) will be sufficient to satisfy NEPA requirements, including Endangered Species Act Section 7 Consultation with USFWS and NMFS and Essential Fish Habitat (EFH) consultation with NMFS. Assume that the USFWS Statewide Programmatic Biological Opinion (SPBO) for nesting sea turtles and the USFWS P3BO for piping plovers will apply to this project. If a hopper dredge is utilized for the project, then the terms and conditions from the NMFS Gulf of Mexico Regional BO (GRBO) should be applied. Use of a cutterhead dredge would require concurrence from NMFS with a “not likely to adversely affect” determination or a separate BO for this project. This scope of work should not include the preparation of a Biological Assessment (BA), EFH Assessment or Environmental Assessment; it is expected that the environmental data provided to USACE during the permit application phase will be adequate to obtain all agency approvals. The environmental and biological criteria needed to justify an expedited permitting process (62B-49.0055, see Section 2 above) will be integrated into this section.
- Environmental, geology, and cultural resources documents developed for permitting and monitoring from the permit agencies for the Collier project over the last 10 years will be assembled and organize on a CD for use by the permit agencies. This will provide an accessible reference for agency action on this repeat project.

7. Prepare Geology Sections

- Results of the past geotechnical investigations will be incorporated into the permit application. Existing permit sketches of Borrow Area T1 should suffice. A compatibility analysis of the borrow areas will be developed for the permit application. No new field work is being proposed.
- Design of a borrow area, preparation of permit sketches and assembling geotechnical data in FDEP format for permitting the Cape Romano sand source subject to availability of funding remaining in this task order after completion of RAI No. 1 response. No new research, investigation or analysis is assumed as part of this task.
- Upland sources will be researched and characterized in addition to the offshore borrow areas. This will include a recent sand sample and laboratory report characterizing the sand supplier product suitable for Collier County beaches. This will allow flexibility of sand source options during emergency nourishment situations. A small report of local sand sources will be prepared along with an analysis of representative mine samples for use in permitting.

8. Prepare Special Plans

- In addition to project-specific engineering and scientific information, the following items will be required to receive a permit for the project. These plans will be based on those prepared for the last permit and will be submitted as data acquisition allows:
  - i. Sediment Quality Control/Quality Assurance (QA/QC) Plan: A revised Sediment QA/QC Plan will be developed and submitted to the FDEP for review and approval. The new plan will integrate the latest sediment data from the project area. Separate plans will be developed for the offshore borrow areas and upland sand sources.
  - ii. Physical Monitoring Plan: The physical monitoring plan for the beach and offshore borrow area will be updated. Monitoring will consist of profile surveys of the beach and periodic surveys of the borrow areas. The plan will be submitted to FDEP for approval.
  - iii. Biological Monitoring Plan: The biological monitoring plan for the beach will be updated, if needed. Monitoring will consist of various diver investigations of the nearshore hardbottom habitat. Results of the 2013 pre-construction dives will be included.

9. Respond to Agency Comments/RAI Phase

- This task includes preparing responses for one (1) Request for Additional Information (RAI) from the Corps and FDEP, as well as travel to visit FDEP offices one (1) time. The FDEP is using an extended information collection period in lieu of RAI No. 2, which will be covered in this task in conjunction with task E. Recommend actions to be taken by the County will be made should they be needed to move the permit process along. Recent experience shows that one round of RAI responses with an extended question period should address all the major issues. Anything beyond a first set of RAI and reasonable extended questions period or equivalent will be discussed with County staff to develop a course of action. Recent physical monitoring results will be provided to FDEP to supplement the permit application.

#### 10. Finalize Permit Application Process

- This task includes: Negotiating Permit and BO Requirements, Issuance of Public Notice, Response to Comments on Public Issuance, Coordination of Final Permit Issuance, and providing last-minute documents to assist agencies in issuing the permit
- This proposed scope of work assumes that the following tasks will not be required based upon recent guidance: a chapter 62B-41.008h survey, Environmental Assessment, Biological Assessment, EFH Assessment, a new Division of Historic Resources investigation of the beach or borrow area, mitigation plan, modeling, and other major field investigations or reports. This scope of work does not include County permitting or other administrative actions. The pending BOEM lease will be good for at least 2 years, and no action will be included towards application of a newer lease. Permit fees will be provided by the County.

#### **Selection Criteria used for Consultant Evaluation and Selection**

1. Firms Credentials and Experience – 40%
  - Provide a “not to exceed” two page “Firm Credential and Experience” narrative that identifies and highlights the firms credentials and experience relative to JCP multi-year beach renourishment permitting, success and cost effectiveness.
  - Provide the resumes of key individual and qualifying experience relative to major beach renourishment JCP permitting that are available resources and assigned to this project.
2. Discipline Experience – 30%
  - Provide a list of projects that includes sufficient detailed description that outlines the firms experience in JCP multi-year beach renourishment permitting, success and cost effectiveness.
3. References – 20%
  - Provide five (5) completed reference forms from clients whose projects are of a similar nature to this solicitation as part of their proposal. The county will only evaluate the first five references provided.
4. Firm’s Location, Availability and Responsiveness – 10%
  - Provide a “not to exceed” two page narrative that identifies demonstrated responsiveness to county needs; availability of resources and identification of firm location.