

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF COLLIER COUNTY
HISTORICAL/ARCHAEOLOGICAL PRESERVATION BOARD

Naples, Florida, October 30, 2013

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, that the Collier County Historical/Archaeological Preservation Board in and for the County of Collier, having conducted business herein, met on this date at 9:15 AM in REGULAR SESSION at the Collier County Growth Management Division – Planning and Regulation, Conference Room 610, 2800 N. Horseshoe Drive, Naples, Florida with the following members present:

CHAIRMAN: William Dempsey
VICE CHAIRMAN: Matthew Betz (excused)
Patricia Huff
Sharon Kenny
Rich Taylor
Craig Woodward

ALSO PRESENT: Ray Bellows, Planning Manager - Growth Management
Fred Reischl, Staff Liaison-Sr. Planner- Growth Management
Elaine Reed, Naples Historical Society

1. **Roll Call/Attendance**

Chairman Will Dempsey called the meeting to order at 9:19 A.M.
Attendance was taken and a quorum established.

2. **Addenda to the Agenda**

Move: Under New Business: 6. B. -to the first item to be discussed.

Add: Under Old Business - A. 1- Update on Mamie Street

Change: Update for the HAPB At-large Vacancy from A. to A. 2

3. **Approval of Agenda**

Sharon Kenny moved to approve the Agenda, as amended, to include the three Addenda item changes. Second by Craig Woodward. Carried unanimously, 5-0.

4. **Approval of Minutes – September 18, 2013**

Patricia Huff moved to approve the minutes of September 18, 2013, as presented. Second by Craig Woodward. Carried unanimously, 5-0.

6. **New Business**

B. BCC Reevaluation of Advisory Boards

Patty Huff spoke about her October 1st meeting with Commissioner Tim Nance who informed her HAPB was one of the Advisory Boards being discussed at an upcoming workshop she had planned to attend. She stated there were now 50 plus Advisory Boards and streamlining was the rationale for disbanding or combining some of them. The HAPB was slated for disbanding or consolidating into a sub-committee the Collier County Planning Commission; and, the only Advisory Board for which no rationale was given. State & County reasons were given for those Advisory Boards left intact. Staff time and money was given as most of the rationales for the action.

In addition to speaking at the workshop, she had written a letter to each BCC member, as a member of the HAPB. No response had been received from BCC members. She wrote about what the HAPB does and what it had accomplished over the years; noting there were legal requirements for the HAPB's purpose. She suggested a meeting with the Commissioners and the whole HAPB to educate the BCC as to the mission, purpose and legal requirements for the HAPB's existence. She asked that HAPB be informed of the next meeting/workshop on the subject.

Sharron Kenny added- Certified Local Government status had certain guidelines and requirements related to Historic and Archaeological Preservation and should remain as a separate Board.

Craig Woodward, after reading a copy of Patty's letter, suggested re-sending it to the Board of County Commissioners from the whole HAPB, with a few wording adjustments. And, ask why the need to change from a separate Board.

Ray Bellows explained another Board (Environmental) was successfully put

October 30, 2013

under the Planning Commission, triggering the BCC to look into other Advisory Boards. He cited the expertise of the HAPB in the Waiver and Review process of proposed developments, and, Certified Local Government status would be lost in either disbanding or consolidating with the Planning Commission. In noting the HAPB's interest and concern and, since no BCC decisions had yet been made, he encouraged them to move forward with the letter from the HAPB.

Will Dempsey acknowledged the cost and staff time was, no doubt, the rationale for disbanding and consolidating Advisory Boards. However, the same would have to be spent for Staff to do what HAPB does as a Volunteer Board, whose expertise, knowledge and historical resources would be lost with disbanding or consolidating.

Sharon Kenny commented on the possible conflict of interest if the Planning Commission, promoting development, took over the function of the Historical Archaeological Preservation Board, which promotes limited development.

***Craig Woodward** moved that Chairman Will Dempsey revise the letter composed by Patty Huff, to include the comments and concerns voiced by the HAPB regarding the value of, and reasons for, keeping the HAPB as a separate board. The letter, from the whole HAPB will be sent to the Board of County Commissioners and the Collier County Attorney. Second by Will Dempsey. Carried unanimously, 5-0.*

To avoid any conflict with the Sunshine Laws, Chairman Will Dempsey will send a copy of the final letter to Ray Bellows and Fred Reischl for them to send on to the rest of the HAPB members. Discussion and approval of the letter will be at the next HAPB meeting.

5. Old Business.

A. (1) Update on Mamie Street (Handout-letter from HAPB)

Patty Huff reported the date of the Public Hearing on the vacation of Mamie Street had been moved from November 12, 2013 to December 10, 2013. Vice Chairman Matthew Betz had written a letter to the BCC members, which was distributed to those present, regarding the HAPB's concerns.

Patty Huff summarized what had since transpired:

- August 12 a complaint was filed as to the condition of the property that was supposed to be maintained (overgrowth with weeds and debris)
- September 2, 26 and October 10- Inspection by Code Compliance found Florida Georgia Grove (FGG) was still not in compliance - Blocking a fire hydrant, with weeds growing over it.
- Property owners (FGG) told Code Compliance not to worry- they were going to be moving the road anyway. (Only if the County vacates the road)
- October 10 - Meeting in Chokoloskee with the Public and County Attorney Jeff Klatzgow, County Commissioner Tim Nance, Nick Casalanguida and the Smallwoods's Attorney, Richard Grant. Thirty-six people attended; all were opposed to the vacation of Mamie Street

as a public road.

- The County had indicated if there was opposition by those living there, those with a direct interest, they will not vacate the road. The general public would be listened to but not considered in their determination.
- Settlement Agreement, between FGG, the Smallwoods and Collier County will not go into affect until the BCC votes.
- The private access agreement between FGG and Smallwood had no provision if the agreement is nullified, terminated, modified or canceled.

Will Dempsey suggested: if the County decides it is in the public interest to vacate the road, they reserve the right (in case of termination/modification of the access agreement) to require the termination/modification be subject to BCC approval- so public access would be protected.

Craig Woodward moved to make the following changes to the letter from HAPB to the County Commissioners regarding the proposed vacation of Mamie Street:

Paragraph 2 –line 2 Replace: *via an access easement with via a public road.*

Paragraph 3—line 2 Delete: *of the vacated street...*

Second by Sharon Kenny. Carried 4-1. Will Dempsey did not vote in order to avoid any possibility of a conflict of interest.

Rich Taylor suggested inserting the only surface between “provides” and “access” in line 2 of the 2nd paragraph of the letter.

Craig Woodward amended his motion to add Paragraph 2, line 2 Insert: the only surface between the words “provides” and “access”. Sharon Kenney amended her second. Amended motion carried 4-1. Abstention by Will Dempsey.

It was noted- though Florida Georgia Grove has had a long history of being non-compliant and uncooperative, HAPB’s concerns were with a historically public access to an historical site.

A. (2) Update for the HAPB At-large Vacancy

Fred Reischl reported the BCC had re-appointed Craig Woodward to the HAPB for another term. The additional seat was still in the application period. Upon its closing, staff will present the applications to the HAPB.

B. Mar-Good County Park Historic Designation Update

Fred Reischl stated he was going to a meeting that afternoon, at which he will find out who the new coordinator for Mar-Good will be and report any updates to the HAPB. The Goodland Arts Group will also be represented at the meeting.

C. Horse Creek Estates Historic Designation Update

This item was tabled to the next meeting agenda

C. Old Marco Inn Certificate of appropriateness Update

Craig Woodward asked to table this item until the next meeting. He will follow up on this item.

D. Hacienda Lakes (aka: Toll Rattlesnake) PUD/DRI Cultural Assessment

Fred Reischl and Ray Bellows explained this item was on the agenda because HAPB, at the last meeting when the Cultural Assessment Waiver for the Willow Run PUD was brought before the HAPB, asked if a Cultural Assessment had been done on the parcel, once known as Toll Rattlesnake, now re-named Hacienda Lakes, located South and East of the Willow Run parcel.

Ray Bellows had researched the property and found a Survey and Assessment had been done by Matthew Betz and was dated October 18, 2006.

Ray Bellows reviewed the process. When a site development plan (SDP) comes in *and the area is within an area of historic or archaeological probability*, the owner is required to contract a certified archaeologist to do a Cultural Survey and Assessment. It was then sent to the HAPB to concur or add their comments, which become a part of the SDP.

Any future plans for development would need a separate Site Plan & Survey and Assessment for any ground or vegetation disturbances.

6. New Business

A. Election of Officers

Craig Woodward moved that the HAPB re-elect the same officers. Second by Sharon Kenny. Carried unanimously, 5-0.

Will Dempsey will remain Chairman. Matthew Betz will remain Vice-Chairman.

B. BCC Reevaluation of Advisory Boards

Taken up previously as First Agenda item discussed.

Sharon Kenny inquired about the construction work being done at the Naples Zoo and who was checking on any impact to the historically dedicated areas, especially the trees.

Ray Bellows explained the site plan that was reviewed showed no impact to the historically designated area. He will double check the site plans.

Fred Reischl provided everyone with a copy of *Preserving Florida's Heritage*, put out by the State of Florida, Division of Historical Resources.

Craig Woodward noted the reference in the Booklet to the list of Certified Local Governments on page 25. He suggested a copy of that page be included with the letter to the BCC, with a notation that Collier County could lose that status should the HAPB be dissolved or incorporated into the Planning Commission.

He also noted the National Register of Historic Places page listed 19 places for Collier County. The number in Lee County was 52 and Miami-Dade, 173.

He suggested looking into moving some Historic places to the National Register.

Patty Huff suggested the Historical Societies of the individual communities start working on reviewing their Historical Places to get the word out on their possible

inclusion on the National Register. She asked that the Spreadsheet be kept up to date; and that Mamie Street remains on the Agenda until it is resolved.

7. **Public Comments**

Elaine Reed commented on the difficulty to excite people on the rich history of Naples and Collier County and its preservation. Apathy, misunderstanding and development interests vie with preservation interests.

Ray Bellows added another reason to keep the HAPB as a separate Board was the educational component it provides, its review of petitions and the Historic Guide.

8. **Board Member Announcements**

Patty Huff reported Ron Jamro suggested contacting Jack Wert regarding the funding for the brochure. Ron Jamro was willing to give up a portion of the museum marketing funds to print the Brochure. She had contacted Jack Wert, who agreed it was a good idea. She will send him the absolute final copy after she makes a few corrections.

Patty Huff also announced:

At the Museum of the Everglades:

- November 2 from 1pm to 3pm - Reception to meet the Photographer - Alan Maltz. There will be a sale and signing of his book, *Journey through Paradise: Naples, Marco Island and the Everglades*.
- November 9 from 1pm to 3pm – Reception for Photographer Constance Meier – *Everglades' Photography by Canoe*
- November 22 – Nostalgia Night - Everglades Historical Society Event- “Where were you November 22, 1963” the 50 the anniversary of the JFK assassination.

Will Dempsey announced:

November 11 from 9am to 5pm, the Military Museum at the Naples airport will hold an all-day Veterans event showcasing new materials and recently acquired equipment. He noted the Airport was built as a military training base where they regularly bombed Gordon Pass barges as part of the training; remnants of some ordinances still remain there.

Craig Woodward announced the Marco Island Museum’s exhibit of Julian Dimock’s photography, *Enchantments*, from January 2 to March 29, featuring 1900-1910 photos and stories of Marco Island and the Everglades areas. It will be part of a traveling exhibit. On January 7, Dr. Milanich will give a talk on the book at an opening reception. There will be additional speakers in February and March.

Fred Reischl left at 10:26 am.

Rich Taylor questioned the huge East Trail project called The Isles and its location in an estuary area. He asked if it would come before the HAPB.

Ray Bellows stated the property was formerly named Sable Bay back in the 1980’s, prior to the HAPB formation. The SDP or Plat would still have to be checked against the probability maps; and, if indicated, routed through HAPB.

The next scheduled meeting will be November 20, 2013, at 9:15 A.M.

October 30, 2013

There being no further business for the good of the County, the meeting was adjourned by order of the Chair at 10:34 A.M.

Historical/Archaeological Preservation Board



Chairman William Dempsey

These minutes approved by the Board/Committee on 11-20-13 as presented X or as amended _____.