

July 18, 2012

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COLLIER COUNTY  
HISTORICAL/ARCHAEOLOGICAL PRESERVATION BOARD

Naples, Florida, July 18, 2012

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, that the Collier County Historical/  
Archaeological Preservation Board in and for the County of Collier, having  
conducted business herein, met on this date at 9:15 A.M. in REGULAR  
SESSION at the Collier County Growth Management Division – Planning  
and Regulation, Conference room #610, 2800 N. Horseshoe Drive, Naples,  
Florida with the following members present:

CHAIRMAN: Craig Woodward (conference call)  
VICE CHAIRMAN: William Dempsey  
Matthew Betz (excused)  
Patricia Huff (excused)  
Sharon Kenny  
Elizabeth Perdichizzi (excused)  
Rich Taylor

STAFF PRESENT: Ray Bellows, Planning Manager- Zoning Services  
Fred Reischl, Staff Liaison, Zoning Services

ALSO PRESENT: Alexandra Sulecki, Sr. Environmental Specialist,  
Parks & Recreation  
Attorney Michael Volpe  
Brad Schiffer, Architect  
John D. Remington,

**I. Roll Call/Attendance:**

**Vice-Chairman William Dempsey** called the meeting to order at 9:17 A.M.  
**Chairman Craig Woodward** was contacted by phone and put on speaker.

*Sharon Kenny moved to allow Chairman Craig Woodward to attend and participate at the meeting via speaker phone. Second by Rich Taylor Carried unanimously 4-0.*

Roll Call was taken and a quorum established.

**II. Addenda to the Agenda:**

1. *Under Old Business –Item B. Replace Horse Creek Estates Update with APA Conference Update*
2. *Under New Business – Item B. – Hart Cottage (COA) will be taken up prior to Item A. Cultural Assessment Gordon River Greenway Park*
3. *Notice from the County Attorney’s Office (Ray Bellows)*

**III. Approval of Agenda:**

*Craig Woodward moved to approve the Agenda, as amended to include the Addenda to the Agenda. Second by Sharon Kenny. Carried unanimously, 4-0.*

**IV. Approval of Minutes: May 16, 2012**

**Correction: Pg. 3 Item B. under VI. New Business: Line 5- replace *but not...* with *and...***

*Sharon Kenny moved to approve the minutes of May 16, 2012, as amended. Second by Rich Taylor. Carried unanimously, 4-0.*

**V. Old Business:**

**A. Chokoloskee Island Update (Steve Williams)**

**Assistant County Attorney Steve Williams** was not present.

**Ray Bellows** stated to his knowledge, there had been no further permitting actions. Nor, had he heard anything from Atty. Williams.

**Will Dempsey** mentioned hearing of ongoing discussions between Florida Grove and Collier County; but, no settlement had been made.

**Ray Bellows** decided to take up item 3. of the Addenda to the Agenda; the Notice from the Collier County Attorney’s Office at this time. He announced Attorney Steve Williams was no longer at that office, having taken a position with Monroe County. Another Attorney will be assigned to the HAPB on an as needed basis.

**B. APA Conference Update (Fred Reischl)**

**Fred Reischl** reported on the American Planning Association Conference to be held at the Waldorf Astoria in Naples from September 12 through September 15. He stated 650 people had already registered. The Everglades



July 18, 2012

City Workshop was filled and the Everglades City Tour was already filled. The Immokalee Workshop still had space, as well as the Immokalee area Tour. Other Tours were being offered; the kayak tour of Clam Bay being the most popular and nearly filled. Registrants were from all over the State of Florida as well as many from other states.

**C. Old Marco Inn Update (Craig Woodward )**

**Craig Woodward** reported there had been no changes at the Old Marco Inn. A large chandelier was offered to the Historical Society, who declined the offer. They had no place for it. At the request of the current restaurant owners, who are leasing space in the Inn, he sent photos he had of that era to them for their architect. Plans were to renovate it close to its original historic nature.

He had contacted the Planning Board who will check with the Building Permit Department regarding any permits submitted.

Craig stated the problem remains of the City of Marco needing to adopt an Ordinance, to mirror the County's, regarding historic properties; and, to create the Interlocal Agreement which had been on hold for some time.

He will keep checking with them.

*Fred Reischl* noted he had spoken recently to Joe Irvin who indicated he agreed with what Craig had stated. Personnel constraints and other priorities were the holdup.

**VI. New Business: (Item B. taken up prior to Item A.)**

**B. Hart Cottage certificate of Appropriateness (New Request)**

**Attorney Michael Volpe**, on behalf of his clients, Mr. and Mrs. Fascher (owners of Hart Cottage) provided background information on their petition for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the structure.

The property was designated historic five years ago. The intent had been to restore and remodel the property. However, the cost estimates to do so had become prohibitive for a structure in an inaccessible location which would be subjected to vandalism and safety issues with no public benefit. Additionally Code violations were ordered to be rectified at an appearance before the Special Magistrate.

The architect and builder consulted were of the opinion that demolishing the structure, with the possibility of rebuilding in the future, was the prudent thing to do.

**Architect, Brad Schiffer and Contractor John Remington** were present to provide professional assessments in detail of that position. The owners were told the demolition will cost upwards of \$40,000.

The HAPB members had several questions for the architect, the contractor and the attorney. They, as a Historic Preservation Board, expressed their reluctance to approve demolishing a *designated historic building*.

A lengthy discussion followed whereby the deteriorating condition of the property and the owner's inability to support the costs involved were considered.

**Mr. Schiffer** offered to provide the data and working drawings to be



stored electronically in the County records for their historic relevance and for future rebuilding.

**Ray Bellows** stated the site itself would remain as a historic place upon which the historically designated Hart Cottage stood; but, had been torn down. He cited Weaver Station as an example of a historic site that refers to a building that was torn down.

*Craig Woodward moved to recommend accepting the Application for the Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the Hart Cottage structure. Second by Will Dempsey. Carried unanimously, 4-0.*

**A. Cultural Assessment of the Gordon River Greenway Park (handout)**

**Alexandra Sulecki**, Senior Environmental Specialist with Parks and Recreation provided a detailed overview map of the area encompassing the Gordon River Greenway Park. She provided background information regarding the Phase 1 Cultural Resource Assessment of the 2.93 acres referred to in a letter from the State of Florida, Division of Historical Resources, to Bob Carr, the archaeologist who did the survey. Copies of that letter were distributed.

The Division had requested additional documentation. They determined the removal of the structure on the parcel, known as “the triangle house” would not effect any historical or archaeological value of area properties listed as historical on the National Register. They also requested a cultural history report to be added to the revised survey report.

**Alexandra Sulecki** noted the property in question was to be used for a kayak launch and parking lot and would include wetland plantings. Discussion revolved around the great value of the project, “the triangle house” and the fact that artifacts were usually found along waterways; noting some re-deposits had been found.

The consensus of the HAPB was to direct the County to move ahead with the project.

*Will Dempsey moved to recommend approving the site assessment pending modifications:*

- a. with regards to the triangle home; reflecting it was not a historic structure worthy of historic designation or preservation, and*
- b. no requirement for the County to have an archaeologist on site.*

*Second by Craig Woodward. Carried unanimously, 4-0.*

**C. Revision to the Historic Preservation Notice Forms**

**Ray Bellows** stated an individual had presented a drafted form of language to be used when notifying builders of the requirement to have an archaeologist present at ground disturbing activities in probable archaeological sites. The form was to be reviewed at the meeting. However, the individual had not contacted the Planning Dept and was not present at the meeting.

Ray noted a Division of Historic Resources approved form already existed. *The item was tabled to the next meeting, if requested by the individual.*

**Notice from the County Attorney's Office** (Previously discussed)  
**Ray Bellows** briefly followed up on his comments under *New Business Addenda Item 3*. He will contact the County Attorney on requests for an attorney's presence at meetings; allowing preparation time for the attorney. He was informed there was not enough staff to have an attorney at *every* meeting.

**VII. Public Comments - NONE**

**VIII. Board Member Announcements:**

**Will Dempsey** provided an update on the pottery and shell tools he and his son had found along Rock Creek several months ago. Matthew Betz had examined them and confirmed they were Calusa pottery; and, the largest (palm size) pieces he had ever seen in the past. He will bring some to the next meeting.

**Craig Woodward** reminded Will, Sharon and Patty Huff to reapply to the BCC for continued service on the HAPB. Their terms will expire October 1, 2012.  
*Ian Mitchell of the County Managers office will be accepting the applications.*

**IX. Adjournment:**

**There being no further business for the good of the County, the meeting was adjourned by order of the chair at 10:23 A.M.**

*There will be no meeting scheduled for the month of August*

*The next scheduled meeting will be held Wednesday September 19, 2012 at 9:15 AM.*

**COLLIER COUNTY  
HISTORICAL/ARCHAEOLOGICAL  
PRESERVATION BOARD**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**Chairman Craig Woodward**

These minutes approved by the Board/Committee on 9-19-12  
as presented X or as amended \_\_\_\_\_.