

August 28, 2007

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COLLIER COUNTY  
FIRE REVIEW TASK FORCE

Naples, Florida, August 28, 2007

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, that the Collier County Fire Review Task Force, in and for the County of Collier, having conducted business herein, met on this date at 9:00 A.M. in REGULAR SESSION at the Collier County Community Development Services Division Conference Room #609/610, 2800 N. Horseshoe Drive, Naples, Florida, with the following members present:

CHAIRMAN: Bradley Schiffer  
VICE CHAIRMAN: William Varian  
Gary Beaumont  
James Boughton  
Dalas Disney  
J. Christopher Lombardo(absent)  
William Schreck

STAFF PRESENT: Roland Holt – Building Official  
Jeff Klatzkow – Assistant County Attorney  
Ed Riley – Fire Code Official  
Joe Schmitt – CDES Administrator  
Paula Brethauer – Operations Analyst

**I. Call Meeting to Order**

*The meeting was called to order by Chairman Bradley Schiffer at 9:00 A.M.*

**II. Roll Call**

Roll Call was taken with a quorum present, The Committee recognized that pending members Angela Davis and Chuck McMahon were also present but not eligible to vote until approved by the BCC.

**III. Approval of Agenda**

Ed Riley provided a handbook that was added to item V - D.

**IV. Approval of Minutes: July 18, 2007**

*William Schreck moved to approve the minutes of August 7, 2007 with the following corrections:*

Page 3, line #3, to read "Address Fire Sprinkler industry."

Page 4, Speakers – Change Chuck McMahon "stated to focus on the building review process."

*Seconded by Dalas Disney. Carried unanimously 6-0.*

**V. Old Business**

**A. Status of vacant seat appointments**

**Paula Brethauer** reported the remaining two member's will be approved at the September 11, 2007 Board of County Commissioners meeting.

**B. Comments of viewing of the March 19, 2007 BCC/Fire Steering Committee Workshop**

It was noted that as the committee progresses they want to make sure to address the concerns presented in the workshop.

**C. Comments on code/statutes sent by Roland Holt. This item will be covered in a future meeting dedicated to it.**

**D. Ed Riley** presented a handout with analysis of the Ordinance indicating what is discretionary and what is a deviation from the State Code.

**VI. New Business**

**A. Water Pressure and Related Policies**

**Paul Mattausch**, Director of Collier County Utilities Department discussed concerns on fire flow and pressure. The following points were addressed:

- The Florida Administrative Code (FAC) code requires a minimum water pressure of 20 psi under fire flow conditions.
- The Collier County Ordinance references the Utility Standards (Ord # 2004-31) created by the Utilities Department which requires a minimum water pressure of 40 psi under fire flow conditions.

- Variances in fire flow test results are a result of demands on the system relative to the time of day and season that the flow tests are conducted.
- Peak flows on the system occur generally in February and March, 12 midnight – 8AM
- The Collier County standards can be changed through the County process.
- A delay in an improvement project slated to be completed in 2002 was not completed until 2004; this required pressure delivery to the main to be artificially reduced to affect demand during this period. This created problems during this time with fire flow tests.
- Fire flow tests conducted during non-peak times can indicate 70 psi, however you have to take into account maximum fire flow conditions (worst case scenario) when designing fire suppression systems.
- Attempts are made to conduct flow test during peak times, but it isn't always feasible.
- Since the 2004 improvements very few fire flow tests have failed.
- System wide pressure can be adjusted in real time.
- The LDC section 6.04.03-B-1 and 2 have conflicting language for minimum psi requirements.
- The purpose of the ISO (Insurance Service Organization) is to develop a set of standards to fight fires, and set insurance rates, not place requirements on a public water system to provide minimum psi or gpm flows in an Ordinance.

**B. Fire Flow – Robert Middleton, Utilities Director, City of Naples**

**Robert Middleton**, Utilities Director for City of Naples addressed fire flows.

The following points were addressed:

- The City does not have an Ordinance that states required flows or pressures; the City bases the requirements utilizing the Florida Administrative Code (20 psi under fire flow conditions).
- A storage tank is filled daily from 9AM – 8PM which restricts fire flows.
- A large amount of development is planned for the Bayshore Drive area within the next 10 years.
- The infrastructure in the Bayshore Drive/Thomasson Drive area is adequate. The water storage tank and related components need to be upgraded. Construction is expected to start next year on the upgrade.
- They have the ability to adjust pressures in real time.
- **Rob Pottieger** of East Naples Fire stated concerns of hydrants that do not have enough fire flow at some locations.
- The Utilities Department is in the process of updating their Master plan/hydraulic models.
- The City of Naples will coordinate their needs with the East Naples Fire Department.
- The City of Naples planned improvement schedule is for the 2007-2008 budget year.

*Break - 10:41 AM*

*Reconvened - 10:56 AM*

**C. Building's Required Fire Flow**

Two documents were circulated for review, an NFPA document entitled "*Annex H Fire Flow Requirements for Buildings*" and an ISO document entitled "*Guide for Determination of Needed Fire Flow*."

**Ed Riley** addressed County guidelines for determination of fire flow requirements for buildings as well as NFPA and ISO standards. The following points were noted:

- The Department reviewed the last 150 commercial submittals comparing the requirements of NFPA - Annex H. vs. Collier County requirements and found the following:

*In 5% of the submittal the requirements were identical*

*In 16% of the submittals the local requirement was more stringent.*

*In 79% of the submittals Appendix H was more stringent.*

- The FAC does not have fire flow requirements; it is left to each independent area (city, county, etc.)
- Fire flow problems generally occur with large buildings or buildings at the end of the system.

A discussion ensued regarding the differences between ISO requirements, the NFPA standards and the Collier County ordinance requirements for *building design elements*.

**The following was determined:**

- *Study a random sample of 10 current projects and run calculations comparing differences in the above requirements.*
- *Review the City of Naples/Collier County Franchise Agreement.*

**SPEAKERS**

**Nick Biondo** of the East Naples Fire District stated his concerns regarding existing fire flows for buildings currently constructed.

**Chuck McMahon** stated the Board should start at the beginning of the Ordinance and permit process and follow through the complete permit process to conduct its review of the issues.

*The permit review process will be placed on a future agenda.*

**Kenneth Notturmo** representing the Unitarian Universalist Church of Greater Naples stated that they currently have a project that meets State requirements; however since County requirements are more stringent they are being required to

August 28, 2007

extend a water main from Pine Ridge to the Church at an estimated cost of \$200,000. He volunteered the Church proposal to be utilized as one of the 10 projects in the study.

**Ed Riley** addressed fire flow requirements for sprinkler systems. He noted the following points:

- Not all fire sprinkler systems are monitored in Collier County.
- Concern - relying on real time adjustments of system flows during emergencies of non-monitored systems.

**D. Open Discussion on Condition of Collier County Fire Protection and Water Supply Requirements Related to Construction.**

None.

**E. Review of available meeting dates**

The next meeting was set for 11:00 AM on September 28, 2007.

**VII. Public Comments**

**Tom Stasko** of Fire-1, LCC stated that contractors providing installations of fire alarm monitoring systems are being affected by the various State and County requirements and the permits required.

*This item will be placed on a future agenda; staff will notify the various contractors so they may be present.*

There being no further business for the good of the County, the meeting was adjourned by order of the chair at 12:40 A.M.

Fire Review Task Force

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Bradley Schiffer, Chairman**

These minutes approved by the Board/Committee on 9/28/07  
as presented \_\_\_\_\_ or as amended  \_\_\_\_\_.