MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COLLIER COUNTY HISTORIC/ARCHAEOLOGICAL PRESERVATION BOARD

April 19, 2024

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, the Collier County Historic/Archaeological Preservation Board in and for the County of Collier, having conducted business herein, met on this date at 10 A.M. in REGULAR SESSION at Margood Harbor Park, 321 Pear Tree Ave., Goodland, Florida, with the following members present:

CHAIRMAN: Zachary Burch VICE CHAIR: Barry O'Brien

Candace Johnson (absent)

Janice OConnell

Elizabeth "Betsy" Perdichizzi Henry "Hank" Sentowski

Vacant seat

ALSO PRESENT: Ray Bellows, Zoning Manager

Timothy Finn, Planner III

Amanda Townsend, Director, County Museums

Any persons in need of the verbatim record of the meeting may request a copy of the audio recording from the Collier County Growth Management Department. (Field trip meetings may not be recorded.)

1. Roll Call/Attendance:

Chairman Burch called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. Roll call was taken and a quorum of five was established.

2. Additions to the Agenda

A. Roberts Ranch Pioneer Museum Certificate of Appropriateness and Site Development Plan Insubstantial Change (SDPI)—PL20240003894

Ms. Townsend detailed the insubstantial change:

- The HAPB toured the Roberts Ranch so the site should be familiar to you.
- It's an American Rescue Plan grant-funded project, an ingenious way to do good history. The American Rescue Plan is for appropriations and responsible building. The focus areas for the funds are communities disproportionately affected by COVID, and Immokalee qualifies.
- One of the project's goals is to improve health outcomes, so we're trying to restore and replace the vegetable garden and citrus grove that previously existed or create a reasonable facsimile. The food produced from that garden and grove will be distributed to community members to improve health outcomes.
- We discovered that we need accessible pathways so people can move through the spaces and that triggers the insubstantial change, adding those surfaces. We'll use a pervious product that looks like a plastic grid, with holes in the bottom.
- We'll lay it down and fill it with a pea gravel and probably top dress it with compressed shell so it will look very natural, like it belongs on the site, rather than putting in a concrete sidewalk or paver pathway. It will be stabilized and ADA-compliant.
- Although it's ADA compliant, any wheelchair user will tell you they don't prefer them, but it's the best balance we can make between keeping the site feeling like a ranch while meeting the needs of patrons and the law. The trick for a wheelchair user is to wear a glove, so it's not terribly uncomfortable, and it's safe.

Ms. Townsend then detailed the project and answered questions:

- Once you walk outside to the back of the Roberts' home, the pathway will pick up there and you will first come to what we're calling Mrs. Roberts' Garden.
- It will be a traditional fenced-off short road. It will look like a pioneer garden would have looked. We'll be able to demonstrate how Mrs. Roberts would have grown vegetables for her family and the cowboys.
- When you move past Mrs. Roberts' garden, there will be a production garden, which is a lot like what you see. We've started bigger, wider, longer roads, where we can produce a better volume of fruits and vegetables.
- The rectangles on the drawing represent ADA-compliant elevated gardens that will enable the community to participate and garden with us.
- Along it, there will be a couple of chickees, so when we take people on tours, we can stop and sit under shade.
- Where you see the squiggly path, that will replicate the former citrus grove, and we'll be able to plant 140 citrus trees. We cannot plant Valencia oranges and others now due to

pests and changes in production, etc., so we won't be planting heritage species. We'll be planting hardy species that we'll be able to harvest and do production with.

- The fun part of the project is that Immokalee is an agricultural town, even though it's also a food desert. We'll be able to help move the needle a bit by giving community members access to fresh fruits and vegetables.
- There's an incredible historical story here about changes in agricultural production, about how it was once done versus how it's done now and why these are the species we used to be able to plant and harvest and these are the new species that we're introducing due to the others being susceptible to pests and diseases.
- There's so much to tell historically and about agriculture and change.
- They used to have to water the plants by carrying buckets of water to all those trees.
- The irrigation at Roberts Ranch the house and the visitor center are on potable municipal water, but the irrigation is on a well.
- The little well pump has been the most difficult part of this project. Because the landscape architect needs a good reading of PSI (pounds per square inch) to know how properly to design the irrigation system. They're fine tuning the system so it will be fully irrigated.
- We're going to a small piece of concrete pad. If you remember when you walked up to the visitor's center, there's a little picnic table under the big oak tree. We want to extend that concrete pad the entire width of the visitor's center and then we'll be able to add more picnic tables to make a nice gathering place when we do programs, or use it as a resting spot after a group has toured the site, so we're going to expand that function there.
- We're excited about this project. The grant award is \$561,000 and we might not spend it all. The landscape architect, formerly Agnoli, Barber & Brundage, now ABB, has been excellent at choosing materials and methods that will be very cost effective and lasting, but still honor the flavor and style of the ranch.
- She beat them up a bit early in the project because she didn't want concrete sidewalks and he was able to find a product that she's excited about.

Ms. Perdichizzi noted that on sandy beaches they use wheelchairs with balloon tires, so maybe a wheelchair would be a good expenditure. It can be used along the gravel walkway.

Ms. Townsend said that's a great idea, especially transferring from the golf cart.

Ms. Perdichizzi said that's what they used at Tigertail Beach or used to use.

Ms. OConnell said many entities nationwide are getting government funds to do things like this. Is it typical for county projects when you have entities like Roberts Ranch to make an application to sort of pay itself? You're generating a fee, you're a county entity, it's a county application, why is there not a waiver process? Why do we pay ourselves?

Ms. Townsend said Tim Finn's department is an enterprise fund, so they have to charge fees to run their operation, unlike public services, where we're primarily funded through property taxes.

Chairman Burch called it a great project that fits in with the site perfectly and ties into Immokalee's agricultural community.

Ms. Perdichizzi made a motion to approve the Roberts Ranch Pioneer Museum Certificate of Appropriateness and Site Development Plan Insubstantial Change (SDPI)—PL20240003894. Second by Ms. OConnell. The motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

3. Approval of Agenda

Ms. OConnell made a motion to approve the agenda. Second by Ms. Perdichizzi. The motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

4. Approval of Minutes: March 15, 2024

Chairman Burch said his name should be Zachary, not Zach, and under Old Business A, under Ray's comments, it says "mobile home image zoning." The word "image" should be stricken.

A discussion over how minutes are transcribed and viewed by the public ensued and the following points were made:

- The minutes are sent to the staff for editing and then sent to the Clerk's Office.
- Minutes that haven't been approved/signed are posted with a draft watermark.
- The approved minutes should be signed after the meeting.
- Staff or the minutes taker can make any changes to the minutes.
- The amended, signed minutes should be sent to the Clerk's Office with agenda attachments and speaker forms.
- If no changes are made, just the signature page can be sent to the Clerk's Office, which will remove the label "draft."

Ms. OConnell made a motion to approve the March 15, 2024, minutes, as amended. Second by Mr. Sentowski. The motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

Action Item: Staff should determine whether the approved minutes and attachments are being sent to the Clerk's Office, which posts them on www.collierclerk.com

5. Old Business

A. Rosemary Cemetery (Plot W) historic designation [Amanda Townsend] (No updates)

B. Letter — Agua Colina Parcel — Conservation Collier

Chairman Burch said we decided at the last meeting that we weren't going to send this letter as a board because it's not appropriate based on board bylaws and enabling legislation. **Mr. Finn** said board members can send the letter individually, but it can't be on county letterhead.

A discussion ensued and the following points were made:

- Since we're not sending the letter as a board, we should take out the first sentence and write an introduction about the sender and why you're writing this letter.
- When we sign it, we sign it as an individual.
- In the last sentence, you can say "I'm ready and willing to work as both a citizen of Collier County and a member of the Historic/Archaeological Preservation Board," which still is mentioning your affiliation but shows it's not coming from the HAPB.
- On bullet point 6, about the maintenance of adjacent properties, Agua Colina and South Terra, it says, "would have made fiscal sense and presented greater flexibility." Rather than complaining about what they didn't do, you could make it more aspirational and say, "would make fiscal sense and present greater flexibility" because you're asking them to do it.

• You don't have to send this exact letter. You can remove points or add points. You're sending it as an individual so you can use this letter is a starting point.

Action Item: Mr. Finn will send board members the Word version of the Agua Colina parcel letter and the email addresses for all commissioners and the county manager so board members can email it personally to everyone on the Board of County Commissioners and County Manager Amy Patterson.

[Mr. Bellows joined the meeting at 10:30 a.m.]

C. Recommendation for Filling Austin Bell's Vacancy

Chairman Burch said Austin Bell left for a state museum job and asked if any applications had been received for his seat.

Mr. Finn said the seat has been advertised but no one has applied.

Chairman Burch told the HABP:

- Heather Otis, who took Austin's position at Marco Island Historical Society, would be a logical replacement.
- The HAPB has representation from five categories and two citizens-at-large.
- Austin's position was history, Barry is archeology and Janice is finance. The rest are citizens-at-large.
- Some board members may be able to be reclassified into another position, such as law, urban planning, architecture, engineering, building construction or landscape architecture. That would get the board more in line with the way it's supposed to be.
- Board members can encourage anyone they know who may be interested, particularly architects, engineers, those in construction, landscape architecture, law, etc., in case Heather isn't interested in taking on a new role.
- Explain to them what we do and the field trips to historic sites on alternate months.

6. New Business

A. Historic/Archaeological Preservation Board Sec. 2-2000.13 Membership, Section E

Mr. Finn reminded board members about the attendance policy. They can have excused absences but must let staff know if they have a conflict, are sick, on vacation or out of town. Board members can lose their seat if they miss two consecutive meetings without an excused absense.

A discussion ensued and the following points were made:

- Alerting staff about an excused absence includes responding to the admin sending emails to ascertain if there will be a quorum.
- Candace didn't call in.
- This is a way to gauge board members' interest in their service.
- County planner Rachel Hansen could be considered as an HAPB member.

[The board moved to Item 7.]

B. Tour of Margood historic site

During a tour of the site led by Ms. Townsend, with questions by board members, the following points were made:

- She's worked on this project since 2004, 20 years.
- Goodland once was a little truck farming community and became a fishing community and winter resort that was very casual.
- In the early 2000s, when real estate went crazy, there were attempts to redevelop small areas of Goodland into high-end condominiums, most notably four to five acres where the boat ramp is. That was permitted, the development order was issued for four four-story condos and the community went nuts, as well they should have. They thought it would dramatically change the character of their community and they did not want that.
- There was enough sway from the community to the Board of County Commissioners that they reversed the development order, which prompted the developers to sue under the Bert Harris Act. In the settlement, the county got the 5-acre property.
- At that time, as it has been for the last 25 years, there was a big push for beach and boating access so a decision was made to build a boat ramp. The community was disappointed because they thought they were getting a park. But the board rightfully said, if we're going to pay \$4 million for this 5-acre property, it needs to benefit all of Collier County, not the 104 households on Goodland. That was in 2002-2003.
- In 2004, the woman who was president of the Goodland Civic Association learned that this 2½ acres also was going to go on sale and she was afraid that what happened at the south end would happen on this basin, so she came to the director of parks to tell her that Elhanon Hannah and Sandy Combs were going to sell Margood resort and the county should buy it under Florida Forever.
- I was the park director's assistant at the time and we drove here and saw this land was wild and wooly, with lots of overgrowth. There were 10 cottages, single-wide trailers, from here all the way to that property line and they were mostly in bad shape.
- The parks director, who wasn't from Florida, didn't even want to go in the front door but I forced her to.

Ms. Townsend detailed acquiring the park:

- We met them and began the process of applying for Florida Forever funds and acquiring the park and it worked out.
- We used the Trust for Public Land as an intermediary and that allowed the trust to relocate residents. There were residents living here year-round and the county didn't want to evict anyone, so the trust acted as the intermediary to help relocate permanent residents.
- We acquired the property and it was a lot of work.
- After we started to develop plans for the site, I moved to Domestic Animal Services for 10 years and didn't participate much in the park site development. Now I'm the museum director and am still saying we have a commitment from the original acquisition, which was \$2 million of state funds, to restore those little fishing cottages that were originally were at Kelly Gant's fish camp on Caxambas.
- They were relocated by Rex and Ruby Johnson, who started this as a resort in 1952.
- Part of what the Florida Forever program does is they want to see you carrying out aspects of your comprehensive plan in your project. The more you're doing to restore native species, the more you're restoring native habitats, preserving archeological and historic sites and providing public education.
- The more you do, the more points you get and the better your chance of funding. This site hit all of them. It's on the water, provides water access, can protect native species and an archeological and historic site. It was made for Florida Forever. We've been slowly

keeping all those promises, but there's one we haven't gotten to yet, restoring the cottages.

- Acquiring, managing and restoring this site over a 30-year lifespan, has cost about \$8 million and 50% was paid by the state, which paid for the acquisition, the architectural work on the cottages, and now there's a 50-50 match on the restoration of the cottages.
- This has been a real win for the community if you look at it in terms of cost share between the state and Collier County.
- I love it down here. It's my favorite place. When I semi-retire, I'm going to have Jim's job at the front desk.

During a tour discussion, the following points were made:

- There are 361 permanent residents on Goodland and 3,000 visitors in season.
- We restored this building, which was a movie theater for the resort early on. Some of the items you see displayed here were collected by the Combs family. When they turned the property over to us, they included all of the contents and we added other acquisitions and donations.
- The late Nancy Olson, a museum division curator and former Park Ranger supervisor, hand wrote many of these displays.
- Ms. Perdichizzi said that's what inspired her to research and write a book about Tommie Barfield and knock on doors here to speak to old-time residents, including an original resident. She wanted to interview them before they died or left.
- Artist Paul Arsenault painted a wonderful picture that hung on the bar, the outside bar. There's a giclée (digital print) of Paul's painting here now.
- When this was functioning as a resort, there was a chickee bar out back called Chuckles Chickee Bar and that's Paul's painting of it.
- This is the original Chuckles sign.
- We were told there's a spring out there and a geodetic marker. There was an artesian well underneath the rubber tree that's been capped.
- Elhanon Combs was sure that artesian well was the Fountain of Youth that Ponce de Leon was looking for. The painting there was done for Elhanon to commemorate that. Elhanon and Sandy have both passed away. They had a big home on Coach House Lane. After they died, the family asked the museum to select a few items.

During Ms. Townsend's walking tour outside the building, the following points were made:

- The county had to do a lot of work on this building when the county acquired it. It's a concrete block structure that wasn't structurally sound so it had to be adapted for this use.
- There was a building beside the basin with a cistern underneath that's still here, but not functioning. It gives you a sense of what it took to have fresh water when this was a 1950s fishing camp.
- When we acquired the property, there was a two2story building on top of this, with a kitchen and artist's loft upstairs. All the signs were hand-painted, probably by Tara.
- The pathway here goes all the way down to the next perpendicular street, where the post office is. There is no door-to-door mail service, so mail goes to the post office.
- Another selling point about making this a public park is that people who live on the other side of the island can cut through the park to get their mail.

[The HAPB and county staff took a group photo outside the building before walking to the waterfront area.]

During Ms. Townsend's tour and questions by board members and staff, the following points were made:

- The area where the county added a playground was filled with small single-wide trailers with six feet between them.
- There are restrooms accessible from the outside, and a few pavilions.
- The paintings outside are evocative of the Calusa tribe.
- The old rubber tree once had a well beneath it and a marker that's no longer visible. Ms. Townsend saw it in seventh grade.
- It was in this circle of rocks and water trickled over into the basin.
- The sidewalks are still in place. The geodetic survey was made in 1878 and a marker was put on the tree.
- This basin spits right out onto the Marco River. The other side is Hell's Gate, fabulous skinny water fishing.
- If Goodland is a circle, there are two basins, one at 1 o'clock and one at 11 o'clock. The Stands Basin and the Drop Anchor Yacht Basin. The mobile home park is called Drop Anchor Mobile Home Park.
- If you're a paddler, this is great place to launch a paddleboard. Around the corner by that blue house, it'll pop you onto the Marco River. If you cross the river, you can get back into Hell's Gate, which is a seawater fishing hole extraordinaire, but watch the tides because you don't want to have to portage out (carry it over land).
- This is a lovely canoe, kayak and paddleboard launching area.
- Hurricane Ian caused a lot of damage. At 10 a.m. that day, the county Emergency Operations Center began swift-water rescue operations. The island was totally flooded. Cars that tried to move out stalled.
- The water was up over the wall and killed many trees, but the bushes are saltwater tolerant.
- When the county purchased this, they had to go through a conditional use process to turn it into a public park. The historic designation was probably done at that time.
- There were rickety little wooden blocks along this shoreline. The mangroves have come back from being demolished, which is part of that commitment in those grant projects.
- The last time Goodland was flooded was during the 1960 hurricane. Kappy's (Katherine Kirk, the Goodland postmaster for 34 years) house is across the street from Little Bar, which was Goodland's high point. She said that was the first aid station and that's detailed in Ms. Perdichizzi's new book.
- Because Kappy had a propane stove, she could cook. Her house is still there and her daughter, Tommie D. Moss, probably owns it. This area is gorgeous.
- The park goes up into their houses on the right-hand side. Up to that point, there's another little pavilion there. People can play bocce there.
- The cottages are in bad shape and are locked. The plan is to keep them historically correct and ensure they're safe, so visitors can go inside.

[Ms. Townsend went to get a key to get inside the cottage area.]

• Ms. Perdichizzi suggested that once the cottages are repaired, each could be used by a vendor to sell crafts and other items.

- Somebody needs to paint it now and then paint it when it's restored.
- Ms. Perdichizzi said the cottages housed fishing guides or tourists, an overflow from the hotel. The 18 cottages were trucked overland in 1949 from Caxambas to create Goodland Point. Only one person lived here and then in the summer 1949, 17 neighbors came with their houses.
- This property was undisturbed because the houses were put down on blocks. This is the way Goodland looked with the trees and landscaping, rustic.

[Ms. Townsend was unable to get a key so they didn't go inside the cottages.]

Ms. Townsend's tour continued and the following points were made during discussions with staff and board members:

- The plan is to demolish this cottage because it's not historically significant. It probably dates back to the 1950s, it's a wreck and those are asbestos shingles, so that will be replaced with an open-air pavilion.
- Behind this, there's a cistern and another two 1920s cottages that were moved here in the 1950s from Kelly Gantt's Fishing Resort (on Marco Island).
- When you move a historic structure, it usually loses historical significance, but we don't consider that with these because even though they were moved, they were in a very similar geographic area and served the same purpose.
- We'll demolish this and restore and use the cistern to irrigate the site.
- The exteriors of the far cottage and this cottage will be restored. Another cottage's interior and exterior will be restored so it can be a walkthrough.
- We'll create a small, elevated boardwalk to connect the three so it will all be ADA-compliant. There are two more cottages behind these cottages.
- The small additions, a shower and a toilet, will be removed.
- In the 1920s, if you were willing to take a train, a boat, a car, etc., to get down to Caxambas to live in a small 8-by-10-foot cabin, there must have been good fishing.
- I struggle sometimes when I go to Tallahassee and defend these grant projects because the Florida Historical Commission, like many do, love theaters, schools and courthouses. They have a different kind of passion, such as homes of famous people and big, grand buildings.
- I love Plebeian architecture. It's really important to remember things that were simple, the way people lived and the things they lived without, like running water and Mosquito Control. You have to think about the character and kind of people who were willing to take a boat, walk and hike and live in that. People thought that was fun then.
- Those were the wealthy people from the north who lived here year-round. They fished on the water and came home, washed their nets and had small gardens. They grew and harvested or made what they needed.
- Kappy described Bud's dogs living under the house and they all got fleas.
- They stored lumber under the house. They took that lumber to build another house and William Ludlow said he was covered with fleas and had to wash off before Marie would let him inside.

• The Norfolk pines will probably go. They're not invasive but they're not native. The gumbos will stay. They're a native tree and are incredibly hardy. The Calusa used them for all sorts of things.

- There may be Calusa artifacts under this area.
- When we acquired the property, we did a small dig. They didn't want to do hand pits and opted for mechanical trenching. We got a little excavator with an 18-inch wide bucket and Eddie Chesser ran the equipment because he's got the best touch with heavy equipment. It was a fun little dig and they found some interesting things and I have a report on it.
- We're going to get to the end of this project and have to keep all of our commitments. It's taken 20 years, but we're going to see it all the way through.
- We just submitted the bid documents to our grants office and the Procurement Services Division said it's ready to advertise. As long as the grants office blesses it, we'll put out the bids and it will probably take a month to get bids back and maybe another month for the Board of County Commissioners to award the contract.
- I'm concerned the bids will be more than the grant amount and that we will then have to revise the scope down. However, bid prices seem to be decreasing and there are more bidders now.
- There is a possibility for a surplus amount of grant money if we revise the scope down but we'd have to think of a way to apply those funds.
- We could revise this scope down, complete as much of the work as we could afford to and then forward a ranked list to the legislature and let the legislature do the appropriation. Then the governor has to sign the annual budget and you have to get a grant contract. That takes about two years.
- Once the legislature starts doing it, they may move it up on the list to finish it. That's one reason we've been successful getting funding for tiny, ugly buildings when they usually fund large, pretty buildings. The state already has invested so much the land and architectural work. They seem to want to keep their commitment.
- The hope is that maybe on Saturdays at 10 a.m. and 2 p.m., we could have a walk-and-talk tour. If we had the budget, we'd get an eight-passenger golf cart in front with free tours to bring people over here. Maybe the historical society and other groups could lead the tours.
- We talked to Kappy, the longtime Goodland postmaster, a long time ago about getting a historical designation for her house but she wasn't interested. Some people don't want the restrictions, despite the possibility of grant money.

[The board then moved to No. 10, adjournment.]

7. Review of Project and Activity Log

Chairman Burch said we'll get an update next month.

[No one had anything they wanted changed.]

Mr. Bellows said they can automatically update the date in the Activity Log.

<u>Action Item: Staff will ensure the date of the Activity Log is automatically updated for each meeting.</u>

[A discussion ensued over Ms. Perdichizzi's latest book, which she provided to board members.]

Mr. Bellows suggested skipping the May meeting to get Austin's vacancy filled and to give staff time to reach out to Rachel and Heather.

A discussion ensued and the following points were made:

- The HAPB can't visit the Indian Hill site today because the meeting wasn't publicly noticed for that location, just Margood Park.
- Indian Hill, Ludlow's Pineapple Plantation and Horr's Island were suggested as possible meeting places.
- You need permission to visit Horr's Island now. They're charging \$10 at the gate at Horr's Island archeological site now because the Board of County Commissioners recommended a historic designation.
- If you say you want to visit the site, they may let you in.
- The next field trip will be later in the year.
- Marco Museum (The Marco Island Historical Society/MIHS) and Everglades City also were suggested as possible meeting sites.
- Marco Museum can be done this summer because it's air conditioned.
- To use the Rose History Laboratory, we'll need to check the MIHS.
- We can make a location decision at the June 21 meeting.

Ms. Perdichizzi said the play she created, The Boston Tea Party, was performed by fifth graders at Tommie Barfield Elementary (TBE) School on Wednesday. We had a community event at the museum after that. One of the teachers said the school now has a historian award and three fourth graders collaborated to write about Tommie Barfield and created costumes and acted it out in five minutes. It was fun to watch when they called her Queen of Marco and crowned her, then said she died and her crown fell off as she fell over. Then they explained how the school was named for her and how proud they were of TBE.

Chairman Burch said he enjoys the HAPB field trips and noted that residents live in their own bubble and don't often go outside their areas. He wouldn't have been in Goodland today if it weren't for this meeting so it's good to see places we don't normally see so we can tell people about them. Most of us haven't been to all the places in the historic places guidebook so it helps us. The Robert Ranch item we voted on today wouldn't have been as impactful if we hadn't visited there. Now it's all going to be changed. The Marco Museum and the bookstore would be good for the next visit.

Mr. Bellows said the reason we're doing these visits is to see historic sites in action and to see where our code needs to be beefed up.

[The board then moved on to 6.B, the tour.]

8. Public Comments:

(None)

9. HAPB Comments

(None)

10. Adjournment

Next Meeting Date:

9:30 a.m. June 21, 2023 Room 609/610, County Growth Management Division 2800 Horseshoe Drive N., Naples

Ms. OConnell made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Second by Ms. Perdichizzi. The motion passed unanimously, 6-0, and the meeting was adjourned.

There being no further business for the good of the County, the meeting was adjourned by order of the chairman at 11:35 a.m.

HISTORIC/ARCHAEOLOGICAL PRESERVATION BOARD

Zachary Burch, Chairman	
These minutes were approved by the board on, or as amended	, as presented (check one)