

**MINUTES OF THE COLLIER COUNTY
COASTAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING**

**Naples, Florida
May 9, 2024**

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, the Collier County Coastal Advisory Committee, in and for the County of Collier, having conducted business herein, met on this date at 1:00 PM in REGULAR SESSION at Administration Building F, 3rd Floor, Collier County Government Complex, Naples, Florida, with the following members present:

Joseph Burke, Chairman
David Trecker, Vice Chairman
Steve Koziar
Robert Raymond
Robert Roth
Raymond Christman
Dr. Judith Hushon (not present)
Jim Burke (not present)
Erik Brechnitz (not present)

ALSO PRESENT:

Andy Miller, Principal Project Manager
Colleen Greene, Assistant County Attorney
Maria Becerra, Liaison, Coastal Zone Management

Anyone in need of a verbatim record of the meeting may request a copy of the video from the Communications, Government & Public Affairs Division or view it online at <http://tv.colliergov.net/>

I. Call to Order

Chairman Burke called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

II. Pledge of Allegiance

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

III. Roll Call

A quorum was established.

IV. Changes and Approval of Agenda

Vice Chair Trecker asked why some of the critical items were left off the agenda.

Mr. Miller explained that the Pelican Bay/Clam Pass Bay item was a little more than we wanted to get into today without all the information. We are still piecing that together and will bring that back in June, as well as the Army Corps position paper. The water quality item, which again we need more information and to coordinate better with the other division so that they have a chance to give a good presentation.

Raymond Christman approved the agenda as presented. Second by Robert Raymond. The motion passed unanimously 6-0.

V. Public Comments

Patrick J. Wack, President of the Seagate HOA, a 90-home residential community; joined by Joann Jenny who represents Naples Cay, a 400-unit condominium complex. Mr. Wack provided a handout to the Board members.

- Our communities about Clam Pass Bay and we would like the CAC to review primarily around water quality, watercraft access and dredging frequency. Water quality over the years has degraded. I have provided some information on that: TN (Total Nitrogen), TP (Total Phosphorus) and DO (Dissolved Oxygen) is considered impaired. There has been a decline in mangrove and seagrass health. We think that this is in part due to inadequate tidal flushing. We believe that this also impacts the quality of the water and quality of life.
- The second issue is watercraft access. In addition to impeding water flow shoaling, which you can see in the map, has led to impediments for safe watercraft access, whether non-motorized or motorized, recreational or commercial. The Pass is dredged every two years. We believe there needs to be an independent examination of the inlet management which considers dredging, water quality and sand placement. We don't want to see this degrade into a lifeless lagoon.

Mr. Christman asked Mr. Miller what will be brought back to this committee in June in terms of how the discussion around Clam Pass will be structured and who will be involved as you understand it.

Mr. Miller: From my point of view, we have an information gathering mission in between now and then and there is an extensive history including litigation. I am uncomfortable without all the information together. When I get what I need to give a

history and some recommendations as far as the direction to go, I'll bring that back in June.

Robert Roth: This non-dredged portion of that area between the inlet and the Outer Clam Bay, does that have an actual name that we can refer to?

Mohamed Dabees, Humiston & Moore Engineers: I am the engineer of record for the management plan for Collier County, Pelican Bay Service District. The section that was from the end of where the dredging now occurs at Section C or the Station 1700 down to Outer Clam Bay was only dredged the very first initial dredging, and it was called cut one, and it extended to the drawbridge, and that was done in 1999. And since then, all the dredgings were limited to the inlet and the flood shoal to Station 17, where seagrasses begin in that section. We do have tidal gauges right at the at the end of the flood shoal, and we have the tidal gauges inside Outer Clam Bay. There is no significant tidal lag between the two, which means the connection between Section C and Outer Clam Bay is not supported hydraulically. The channel that was dredged was a straight channel that over time has meandered and anyone who kayaks or canoes in that section, it is a meandering path that is not necessarily in line with what was dredged in 1999. Since then, the Pass has been dredged and studied several times. When the current management plan was approved by the Collier County Commission in 2015, it was done over basically two or three years, including 22 public meetings. Because of all the input from different stakeholders and different groups it was meant to achieve two things – primarily the health of the mangroves and the Bay system as a NRPA (Clam Bay Natural Resource Protection Area), which is the only NRPA in Collier County. And then secondly, maintaining all the recreational and other benefits in the system. But the primary reason for the management, the title gauges, the monitoring, the biological and the physical monitoring that occurs on a yearly basis is the health of the mangroves and then all the environmental restrictions that limits what we can and what we cannot do.

A discussion ensued and the following points were made:

- We will call it the 'channel to Outer Clam Bay'
- Dredged in 1999, one time; it was straight and now it has become meandering due to natural sediment
- The initial permit was issued in 1998, renewed in 2012 and the current permit expires in 2027 and this permit is for the Clam Pass Inlet
- The permit does not reference this leg.
- The initial permit also includes Cuts 2, 3 and 4, which were in Upper and Inner Clam Bay, which included removal of some of the mangroves to allow the Upper Clam Bay to flush, but the flushing of Upper Clam Bay is a mere fraction of the flushing in Outer Clam Bay
- Is the water quality impacting the seagrass and the health of the mangroves? There's not a lot of seed, less than 5%. For the seagrass coverage, the take-away is there is not a lot, and it has been declining over the years. This area referred to is Cut 1. The permit is labeled Inlet.
- The water quality is the issue, whether it is being adequately flushed or not.

- It is a peripheral area. That is an oversight of the permit, and the permit doesn't address it because it is a mangrove area that is associated with the permit.
- The action and the interest is in the North, not in the South.

Sidebar item: Decision to discuss this matter further at the next meeting or hold off when Mr. Wack is back from Europe.

VI. Approval of CAC Minutes – April 11, 2024

Robert Roth approved the minutes. Second by Steve Koziar. The motion passed unanimously 6-0.

VII. Staff Reports – Extended Revenue Report

Mr. Miller shared with the committee members that he received the report this morning and had an opportunity to look at it and give you better news related to the trajectory. The trajectory has recovered, and we are back in good form, and we are getting ready to head into the annual decline. But the news is good. This information will be available at the next meeting. The April number is March revenues.

Raymond Christman mentioned hearing a rumor that the BCC is looking into playing around with some of the numbers. Mr. Christman asked Ms. Greene to provide the members with the exact amount of money that goes to each fund.

Colleen Greene stated that it is set forth in the ordinance and will bring a copy to the next meeting or email it after the meeting today.

A discussion ensued and the following points made:

- The reserves in the 1105 beach renourishment fund are currently around \$43M and projections at the end of the fiscal year would be about \$46M which are ample reserves which is a good thing. If we get a bad storm, that money can get used quickly. But it begs the question that perhaps this committee will want to tackle someday recommending useful things to use this money as reserves grow. It becomes more visible to people, and we want to make sure that those funds get used in the right way for the purpose for which they were generated.
- We all want to be a good steward of that money and not spend it simply because it is there.
- But to play devil's advocate, you run the risk when a fund grows too big and sits too many years unused, people start to look at it and suggest it be used for other things. I think there is a potential vulnerability as it grows to a certain level.
- The US Army Corps of Engineers will make recommendations on several things that could and should be done. It could take years for a plan to get approved in Washington. At some point, the County may wish to undertake individual projects individually suggested by that plan and our 1105 fund could be a source.
- The fund became very visible when the County borrowed a large chunk of it for the sports park. The County has started the repayment of that loan in the last fiscal year.

VIII. New Business

1. ES – Marco Island Tigertail – Cat A Application Marco Island Tigertail Sand Dollar Maintenance – revised

Andy Miller: The recommendation is to approve tourist development tax fund 1105 funding in the amount of \$350,000 for the maintenance of the Tigertail Lagoon/Sand Dollar Island Ecosystem Restoration project; the necessary budget amendment and make a planning that this expenditure promotes tourism.

Justin Martin, Public Works Director, City of Marco Island:
PowerPoint Presentation

The City of Marco Island is requesting tourist tax funding of \$350,000 as part of an interlocal agreement to assist in the ongoing maintenance of the Tigertail Lagoon/Sand Dollar Island Spit Ecosystem Restoration Project area. And this \$350,000 is going to be part of a biannual maintenance program. Most of you are probably familiar with this project since we were here about a year ago requesting some funding for a change order to the project that restored this area after Hurricanes Irma and Ian.

Mr. Martin gave an overview of the areas located on the map – Sand Dollar Spit; Collier County Tigertail Beach Park; Capri Pass/Big Marco River Channel; Hideaway Beach; Marco Island; Tigertail Lagoon Entrance

The city and the county need to protect their investment in this area by doing smaller maintenance every two years and reducing the need for extensive future projects. The conditions after Hurricane Irma and Ian, the shoreline was pushed into the mangroves and a lot of the mangroves died; and wooded mangrove areas which got overrun by storm surge and the sand from that was pushed up into it.

The restoration project includes three main elements. The first one was a nature based multi-tier coastal resiliency system consisting of a sand spit, a coastal lagoon and a mangrove shoreline. And the second was maintenance of the lagoon flow channel to restore the tidal exchange to improve water quality. A third component is to provide a renewable sand source at the northern tip of the spit from which sand could be recycled to eroding areas and by which the growth of this spit into the navigation channel could be limited. What happens is over time, if left alone, the sand migrates, and it accumulates in the northern part of this spit and would threaten the navigation channel of Capri Pass and close this off entirely, thereby providing a dead lagoon with no tidal flushing. This was designed by Humiston & Moore to be a project that has recyclable sand, taking it from what is called the sand trap and then recycling that back to where it erodes from in the other parts of the spit.

When the city manager presented this maintenance proposal for TDC funding, the county manager requested that we look at this this proposed maintenance in the context of a regional management plan.

It is worth noting that as of this year, we now have American Cruise Lines that stops in Marco Island.

If we do a two-year maintenance, we take whatever is there in the sand trap, excavate it mechanically, and then bring it back up to maintain the beach berm. We have a sand source offshore borrow area that is part of the permit. We have the flow channel; we have the sand trap; and then also Collier Creek. Whatever is dredged there can be used to renourish other areas. As part of the management plan, we have a program for regular surveying that is being done according to the permits to monitor the physical changes that are occurring throughout the area. We have a lengthy biological monitoring plan required by the permit for the area. This year's monitoring plan was over 1,000 pages, so the city is taking care of all this monitoring and the consulting that is required with it.

What we are asking for is assistance with the funding for the actual moving of the sand.

The entire management plan is broken down into five key components and the work that is being done by each party.

The key benefits of the Tigertail Lagoon/Sand Dollar Island maintenance plan are outlined. With this project you maintain the tidal flow to the county park or that Tigertail Lagoon. Prior to this project, the Lagoon had very limited tidal flow going into it and the water quality had degraded such that you had a lot of the vendors that were in Tigertail Beach Park choosing to not do business there anymore because business dried up – no one wanted to go to a lagoon that was deteriorated. And then the ecosystem environmental resources are protected for the public benefits. You have also coastal resiliency. It provides a first line of defense against storm surge and wave action from hurricanes, and you have a lot of boating access to the lagoon and the shoreline. This is now like the southern tip of Keewaydin Island, where you have all the rental boats and the boaters that anchor on the tip of the Sand Dollar Spit. Beachgoers also come from Tigertail Beach Park, and you have a lot of enthusiasts for shore birds that come just to do some bird watching. We do have a lot of protected species of shore birds that nest there.

The last point I wanted to mention was that to be eligible for FEMA reimbursement in case of major storms, you must show that you have a maintenance program and that you are maintaining this area. Why we are here today is to get approval for an interlocal agreement between the county and the city for the funds to maintain this. The compliance items and the maintenance, the city would take care of the management of it; we would do the contracting, we take care of all the permit compliance items with the state and the consulting services that are required. The only thing that we are asking for is funding support for the actual moving of the sand.

This is over a two-year period – 2024, 2025. The city's component of that and what the city contributes is about \$372,000 and then the county's component would be the

request that you have here for \$350,000. And this amount is for paying the contractor to do the moving of the sand, although the city will be putting it out to bid, doing all the contract paperwork and managing the construction.

Discussion ensued on the following:

- Clam Pass has been receiving TDC funds for many years
- The \$350,000 will be a biannual request
- Tourism related – boat traffic and beach park
- 50/50 split – special taxing district of the city; and county
- These passes all change/shift over time; markers get moved; recommending a survey every two years to monitor the water and provide information to the Coast Guard
- Dredging would require more effort for studies and evaluation and permitting through the state and Army Corps of Engineers
- All projects and permits that are active will be in the management plan; any additional source, like a navigation channel, will need a new permit; as the monitoring continues, it will advise when we need to add to the dredging templates
- You work with nature and make sure that you line your channel with the flow; if you continue to dredge you will end up impacting the beaches
- The environmental consultant concurred with the state that they would like to see if the dying mangroves and roots covered in sand will recover and evolve naturally; it is a protected area
- The \$350,000 is the maximum – any additional funds would require an amendment which would require a recommendation from this board, the TDC and the BCC; it is one of our tourist development tax grants – a CDC grant agreement and it is reimbursable

David Trecker made a motion to approve the recommendation. Second by Robert Roth. The motion passed unanimously 6-0.

2. 2024.04.29 - ES – BCC – 2024 Hardbottom; CSA Work Order

Andy Miller: This is an annual effort we make as part of our permanent responsibilities related to our renourishment projects. We have hardbottom coral communities that parallel our beaches; in general, there are 500 to 1,000 feet again parallel to the beach. The FDEP would like us to make sure that our renourishment projects don't encroach onto those hardbottom communities and cause issues with the creatures that thrive there. We hire a consultant, CSA Ocean Sciences, who does this effort for us every year. They go out in a boat, scuba dive and measure, video and prepare exhaustive reports on the condition of the coral communities. The recommendation is to approve a work order for CSA Ocean Sciences Inc to continue the required post construction hardbottom monitoring for the Collier County Beach Renourishment project in the summer of 2024 for time and materials not to exceed \$368,494.04 tourist tax development funds under Professional Services Agreement 22-8015 authorize the chairman to execute the work order and make a finding that this item promotes tourism.

Vice Chair Trecker asked why the cost is heftier compared with past monitoring.

Mr. Miller stated it is similar. It is a new contract meaning they have incorporated cost increases related to inflation, etc. This is a three-year contract with a couple years of renewals. They are going to build in some cost increases to accommodate those five years of work. The executive summary will tell you that it is \$10,000 less than what they spent last year. It does not include an effort that we did last year, which was side scan sonar. This executive summary and scope of work also includes several aquatic vegetation seagrass surveys for Doctors Pass and Wiggins Pass knowing that we are probably not going to be doing dredges for those Passes. Those efforts will probably not be needed so the costs will come down.

Raymond Christman made a motion for approval including a find that this action promotes tourism. Second by Robert Raymond. The motion passed unanimously 6-0.

IX. Old Business

None

X. Announcements

Chairman Burke brought up that this is Mr. Christman's last meeting.

Raymond Christman stated he believes Linda Penniman will succeed him. Mr. Christman gave a thank you to his colleagues on the committee and staff.

XI. Committee Member Discussion

None

XII. Next Meeting Date/Location

June 13, 2024, at 1:00 p.m.

No meeting scheduled in July or August.

XIII. Adjournment

There being no further business for the good of the county, the meeting was adjourned by order of the chairman at 2:05 p.m.

Collier County Coastal Advisory Committee

Joseph Burke, Chairman

May 9, 2024

These minutes were approved by the Committee on _____ (check one) as presented, _____ or as amended _____.