

January 20, 2023

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COLLIER COUNTY  
HISTORIC/ARCHAEOLOGICAL PRESERVATION BOARD

January 20, 2023

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, the Collier County Historic/Archaeological Preservation Board in and for the County of Collier, having conducted business herein, met on this date at 9:30 A.M. in REGULAR SESSION at the Collier County Growth Management Division – Planning and Regulation, Conference Room #610, 2800 Horseshoe Drive North, Naples, Florida, with the following members present:

CHAIRMAN: Austin Bell (excused)

VICE CHAIR: Barry O'Brien

Zachary Burch

Candace Johnson

Elizabeth "Betsy" Perdichizzi

Henry "Hank" Sentowski

ALSO PRESENT: Andy Youngblood, Operations Analyst  
Ray Bellows, Zoning Manager  
Tim Finn, Principal Planner

*Any persons in need of the verbatim record of the meeting may request a copy of the audio recording from the Collier County Growth Management Department.*

**1. Roll Call/Attendance:**

**Acting Chairman O'Brien** called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m. Roll call was taken and a quorum of five was established.

**2. Additions to Agenda**

None

**3. Approval of Agenda**

**4. Approval of Minutes: July 15, 2022**

*Ms. Perdichizzi moved to approve the December 16, 2022, minutes. Second by Mr. Sentowski. The motion passed unanimously, 5-0.*

**5. Old Business**

**A. Rosemary Cemetery (Plot W) historic designation [Amanda Townsend]**

**Mr. Bellows** noted that at the last meeting, Museums Director Amanda Townsend indicated that she wasn't in a position to further the research on that and she's not here today to provide an update.

*[The board returned to this item later in the meeting, after member introductions.]*

**Mr. Finn** said Amanda Townsend Skyped him some updates. The title work has been received and is being reviewed by the county Legal Services department. Eagle Scout Jonathan Rodriguez will be participating in the project with her.

**Ms. Johnson** asked about the eight graves in Rosemary Cemetery.

**Bellows** said the eight unmarked graves are in Plot W. They need to figure out who owns that parcel and who is buried there. It's probably people who worked on the trail (U.S. 41).

**Ms. Johnson** noted that would be of interest to the NAACP and asked if they're working with NAACP representatives.

**Mr. Bellows** said the NAACP and another person who wanted to initiate the historic designation used to attend HAPB meetings.

**Ms. Perdichizzi** said the project is a great one for an Eagle Scout to bring to fruition and add to his resumé.

**Mr. Burch** said if they need assistance with the NAACP, he knows its president, Vincent Keeeyes very well and can contact him.

**Mr. Bellows** said he'd ask Amanda about her communications with the NAACP.

**Michael Brownlee**, the county's records management liaison officer, said he wanted to monitor this meeting to understand what the historical and the preservation part of the HAPB's role is, and to understand it from a records management perspective. Sometimes when it comes to the disposition of records, there are retention periods, but there are occasionally items that get considered for disposal, unless it has archival value.

January 20, 2023

He's in the learning process to try to understand archival value, which is subjective. He's been in Naples since 1997, he's interested in history, and is a former radio guy. His backup for records management-type functions also is here, Angel Bates.

**Ms. Perdichizzi** <sup>*Dei*</sup> asked what records management was.

**Mr. Brownlee** said they work for a state agency and all records have different retention periods, depending on the type of document. The state dictates that. From time to time, we need to dispose of records, but not before their retention period has passed. Records include audio tapes and pictures. The Centennial is this year, so he also was curious about the connection this board has with that.

**Ms. Bates** said she does public record requests for the county Communications Department and is learning about records retention. Her background is in primary education.

**Mr. Burch** said he appreciates their work and that history isn't thrown away. Rules of retention are better now.

**Acting Chairman O'Brien** thanked them for attending the meeting, saying their work is vital to the county.

**Ms. Perdichizzi** asked about obtaining records before Collier County was incorporated, when it was part of Lee County. She was told those records are in Fort Myers.

**Mr. Brownlee** said it's always a challenge to determine who the custodian of records is. They start with the state. But records about the county's incorporation are in the County Manager's Office.

## **B. Update on HAPB Guide Booklets Reorder**

**Mr. Finn** said they received 48 boxes of the historical guide booklets a few days ago. Board members were provided with a copy. The only change is the Centennial emblem on the cover. The museums stopped by yesterday and took 12 boxes.

**Ms. Perdichizzi** noted that HAPB members can take some booklets.

**Mr. Bellows** said they also give the booklets to various historical societies and Collier County Public Library system.

## **6. New Business**

### **A. Welcome New HAPB Members**

**Mr. Bellows** welcomed the new members and said that we're full with a seven-member Historical Architectural and Preservation Board. We always need four members for a quorum and try to reach out before each meeting to ensure we have a quorum, so you don't drive here and find the meeting canceled. We meet the third Friday of each month at 9:30 a.m. and sometimes take breaks during the summer.

**Ms. Johnson** stated that it was technically her third meeting, she has a non-profit administration background and appreciates the chance to volunteer to be on this board and be aware of what's going on.

#### ***Mr. Sentowski introduced himself and provided his background:***

- He's been a Florida resident for 10 years, half as a snowbird and five as a full-time Collier County residents.
- He lives in Verona Walk, where he's on several ad hoc committees.
- He was the past chairman of the Verona Walk Architectural Control Committee for 2½ years and was responsible for approving applications involving exterior construction, landscaping and other items. That committee was very active and handled about 600 applications yearly. There are 1,920 homes in Verona Walk on nearly 1,000 acres.

- He loved that work, is interested in preservation and thought the HAPB would be a good fit.
- He was born and raised in Brooklyn and raised his kids on Long Island.

***Acting Chairman O'Brien provided his background:***

- He's from Warwick, Rhode Island.
- He spent 16 years on the historic and architectural commission in Warwick.
- Many homes there are 100 to 200 years old there.
- He used to participate in Civil War re-enactments.

***Ms. Perdichizzi provided her background:***

- She's from Oklahoma and moved here in 1989.
- She was interested in genealogy and the history of how people lived.
- She and her husband, who has a background in computers, graphics and layout, have published seven historical fiction and non-fiction books.
- She headed a re-enactment group 25 years ago with costumes and performed as theater. They created personalities of local history, the presidents and presidents' wives. It's a wonderful way to learn history.

***Mr. Burch provided his background:***

- He's the communications manager for Naples Airport.
- Before that, he worked for the state Department of Transportation and the state Legislature.
- He's always been interested in history and architecture.
- He's lived here since he was 10, when he moved from Virginia.
- He attended many Civil War re-enactments in Virginia.

**B. New Member Presentation**

*[Mr. Bellows detailed a PowerPoint presentation]*

**Mr. Bellows** said he and Tim wanted to go into a presentation, discussion and general overview of the relationship between the HAPB and Collier County government, more specifically, zoning and land development in Collier County. He stated that:

- When a developer wants to rezone 300 acres for a mixed-use residential commercial development, how does the county know that it's going to impact an archaeological site or historic structures within that property that they want to develop?
- Working with a consultant, we created a map showing areas of known archaeological sites, known historic structures listed on the Florida Master Site File and/or have been designated historic by Collier County, as well as areas of archaeological probability.
- There was a scientific study of soil borings and the archaeology firm we hired created maps that shows areas of archaeological probability in yellow.
- If a rezone application came in and was in an area of historic archaeological probability, the developer is required to hire a certified archaeologist to conduct a cultural assessment of the property.
- At the last meeting, we saw an example of an assessment that was brought to the HAPB.
- Developers have the ability to ask for a waiver from conducting a cultural assessment if the site had been previously excavated for a quarry, etc. There's no sense spending money on archaeologists if the site was damaged through past construction activities.
- Before we take a rezoned petition through the Planning Commission and Board of County Commissioners, we want to know if there are archaeological sites or historic structures. If

there are, what are the conditions we want to impose on the developer to protect archaeological or historic artifacts?

- The report that we receive from the archeologists may have conditions to help protect these historic or archaeological sites and we incorporate that into the recommendation to the Planning Commission. The report contains a summary of HAPB findings and recommendations.
- The HAPB may agree with the consultant the applicant hired or may have additional conditions it wants to impose.
- We forward those recommendations to the Planning Commission, which will deem whether they're appropriate or not, and then it's brought to the Board of County Commissioners for a final decision and the BCC creates an ordinance that contains all conditions of approval, including preservation conditions.
- The next step in the development process, once zoning has been entitled, is going through the site development plan, which looks at zoning approval and the conditions. The county wants developers to adhere to the conditions of approval so when the county sees the plans being submitted, they can make sure the developer is staying out of any areas that were designated archaeologically sensitive so they don't accidentally dig up those areas.
- We had a situation where a developer failed to follow those directions and excavated a designated archaeological site. There are penalties for that, so we try to ensure our processes help protect those sites. What came out of that incident was better marking of sites, so when they hire a company to come in and excavate a site for development, they must mark areas that are deemed either environmentally sensitive or archaeologically sensitive.

**Mr. Finn** said he and Candace were talking about this and the Stewart Mining East Extension earlier, before the meeting. The HAPB recommended approval based on the archaeological assessment from that agent.

**Ms. Johnson** asked if they're done with the process after giving approval or are there follow-ups?

**Mr. Finn** said the Stewart Mining Extension was approved. We accepted all the findings in the report and we take the HAPB approval and incorporate it into the staff report.

**Ms. Johnson** asked if there are no archeological findings is the HAPB done?

**Mr. Bellows** said it's not required to come back to the HAPB. The way the code is written is that the first petition type that comes in is usually at the rezone stage. If it was rezoned in the 1970s before we had this process, the next step would be a site plan. When that comes in and there was no cultural assessment done earlier, then we require it at subsequent stages, but you only see it once. Once those conditions are incorporated in the development, then they go into the building phase.

**Mr. Burch** asked if there was a definition of what's historic, a time frame for significance?

**Mr. Bellows** said the Collier County Land Development Code contains all the unified development regulations. There is a zoning overlay dealing with historic preservation, and within that are all the definitions and criteria for what is deemed historic. Historic structures can be deemed historic if they're 50 years old or more.

*A discussion ensued and the following points were made:*

- There are six or seven criteria for a site to be designated historic by the Board of County Commissioners.
- That includes if there is land or structures associated with someone historic, such as the founders of Collier County.
- If there's an architectural design or style that is unique, those could be historic.

- If a study found a Calusa Indian burial mound, are the archeological sites we want to protect.
- The code spells out all the criteria.
- If a site is designated with a Florida Master Site File number, detailed information on how that structure is deemed historic is in the Florida Master Site File. That information is with the Florida Bureau of Historic Preservation and county staff also can look them up.
- The county works with the builder/developer early on and tells them if they're in an area of archaeological probability or there are historic structures on the site. The county tells them they need to hire an archaeologist or a historic architect to work with them to help protect those buildings and archaeological artifacts.
- There are several layers of historic designations. Many sites are just listed as having historic qualities but have not been designated by the County Commission as historic or listed on the National Register of Historic Places.
- If something is designated or listed on the Florida Master Site File as having historic significance, the next step would be to have it locally designated by the Board of County Commissioners. Once it's locally designated, it's protected.
- There's no requirement for property owners or developers to spend a lot of money to keep it at a certain level. There are state and federal grants to help people protect and preserve structures from further deterioration, but Collier County government doesn't have a grant program for that. It's up to the property owners.
- If the HAPB disagrees, it won't issue a certificate of appropriateness.
- If the HAPB agrees with what a study says, that it won't affect the historic quality of the site, the HAPB can approve it and the developer can then go through the next permitting-process step.
- County staff will not process a site development plan or building permit on a site that's locally designated historic without the HAPB weighing in and saying it agrees or disagrees with the changes. That's one level of protection.
- There are some jurisdictional issues, such as the county can't tell Everglades City what to do.
- Robert's Ranch was designated historic after Amanda Townsend brought in the plans for the HAPB's review. Once approved, she was able to hire a builder to make changes.
- When a site is designated historic by the BCC, the documents are kept by the Clerk of Courts and in the records room in the Growth Management building.
- Any historic designation, application or any rezone application that involves historic sites are all maintained in our CityView computer database. Any studies that come out of that, such as certified archaeologists' reports, are kept in CityView, which also contains cultural assessments.
- Cross-hatching on the probability maps shows that it's an area studied by archeologists and a report was submitted.
- Every five or 10 years, we work with the State Preservation Board to update the county maps.
- The idea is that when the Board of County Commissioners looks at a future development, we want to convey to the BCC whether there are archaeological resources or historic structures there. We don't let the developer demolish or alter those things without going through a process to determine if it's appropriate or not.
- If a site is designated historic, the map shows a solid circle with the Florida Master Site File number on it.
- Collier County is one of the faster growing counties in Florida. The push eastward is encroaching into these rural areas. Typically, archaeological sites are along streams, rivers or marshlands, where original Aboriginal Indians and natives primarily had their fish camps.

January 20, 2023

- Unfortunately, those were the first areas to be developed in Florida and that was prior to the HAPB being formed in 1991 or 1992.
- Collier County went through the extra qualification process to be deemed by the state as a Certified Local Government, meaning we can bypass and don't have to coordinate with the Florida Bureau of Historic Preservation. Collier County can initiate historic designations and National Historic Register designations.
- The historic guide has a list of structures that have historic significance of some level and who designated them historic.
- There are a lot of county sites on the National Historic Register and they're listed in the booklet.
- The property owner next to the historic Smallwood Store dug up a road that turned out to be county owned and had to put it back to its original condition. There was some excavation of an archaeologically sensitive area, but nothing of significance was found in the rubble. They were required to hire a certified archaeologist to study that.
- When the county believes there's an ongoing issue, it can flag a property in the computer system, such as when there's a code case or a situation where restoration is required.
- The property next to the Smallwood Store was sold, so Mr. Bellows plans to ask if there are plans for that site.
- All of Chokoloskee is an area of archaeological probability.

**7. Review of Project and Activity Log**

The Board reviewed Rosemary Cemetery on the "Collier County Historic and Archaeologic Preservation Board Project & Activity Tracking Log."

**8. Public Comments:**

None

**9. HAPB Comments**

None

**10. Adjournment**

The next HAPB meeting will be held on February 17, 2023, at 9:30 a.m.

*Ms. Perdichizzi moved to adjourn the meeting. Second by Mr. Sentowski. The motion passed unanimously, 5-0, and the meeting was adjourned.*

There being no further business for the good of the County, the meeting was adjourned by order of the chairman at 10:30 a.m.

**HISTORIC/ARCHAEOLOGICAL PRESERVATION BOARD**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
**Barry O'Brien, Acting Chairman**

These minutes were approved by the board on \_\_\_\_\_, as presented (check one)  
\_\_\_\_\_, or as amended \_\_\_\_\_.

