

MINUTES OF THE COLLIER COUNTY
COASTAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING

Naples, Florida, November 10, 2022

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, the Collier County Coastal Advisory Committee, in and forthe County of Collier, having conducted business herein, met on this date at 1:00 P.M. in REGULAR SESSION at Administrative Building “F,” 3rd Floor, Collier County Government Complex, Naples, Florida, with the following members present:

CHAIRMAN: David Trecker
VICE CHAIRMAN: Joseph Burke
Steve Koziar
Thomas McCann (excused)
Jim Burke
Robert Raymond
Robert Roth
Raymond Christman
Erik Brechnitz

ALSO PRESENT: Andy Miller, Coastal Zone Manager
Colleen Green, Assistant County Attorney
Farron Bevard, Management Analyst I

Any persons in need of the verbatim record of the meeting may request a copy of the video recording from the Communications, Government & Public Affairs Division, or view it online.

I. Call to Order

Chairman Trecker called the meeting to order at 1:03 p.m.

II. Pledge of Allegiance

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

III. Roll Call

Roll call was taken and a quorum of eight was established.

IV. Changes and Approval of Agenda

Chairman Trecker said he wanted to add an item, the Army Corps of Engineers Project, under IX, Old Business.

Vice Chairman Burke moved to approve the agenda, as amended. Second by Mr. Raymond. The motion was carried unanimously, 8-0.

V. Public Comments

None

VI. Approval of CAC Minutes

September 8, 2022

Mr. Christman moved to approve the minutes of the September 8, 2022, meeting. Second by Mr. Raymond. The motion was carried unanimously, 8-0.

VII. Staff Reports

1. Extended Revenue Report

“FY22 TDT Collections Revenue Report” dated September 30, 2022.

A discussion ensued and the following points were made:

- Revenues have been good for the past year.
- Actuals to budget exceed expectations by nearly 61%.
- Fund 195 has a \$6.7 million positive variance, which may help after the hurricane.

III. New Business

1. Presentation – Hurricane Ian

Chairman Trecker said the main reason for today’s meeting is to provide an update on the emergency program dealing with Hurricane Ian’s destruction countywide, what’s been done and the steps that are being considered. No vote is needed. The goal is to get people back on the beach safely and to build in some minimal protection as soon as possible, so timing is important. This is just a status report. We don’t have all the survey data or any engineering recommendations yet but will know more about that in December.

[Mr. Miller detailed a PowerPoint presentation status report showing before and after photos.]

Mr. Miller made the following points during the presentation:

- This is an online PowerPoint site visit to various beaches to show before and after the damage.
- Barefoot Beach took the worst hit countywide. On September 29, the day after the hurricane, we arrived on the scene and it was a mess. Luckily, many structures in the community were built with their first floors above flood elevation, but they still ended up with a lot of debris and cars in their lower floors and garages.
- All the vegetation in and around the dunes was destroyed, literally scraped away, and a mixture of the two wound up on the beach.
- We realized we needed November and December to get beaches cleaned up for season.
- Prior to the hurricane, this board approved several contracts for emergency cleanup, in case something like this happened, so we had cleanup contractors prepared and ready to go.
- Lower floors were essentially sacrificial structurally and everything blew through there.
- A lot of expensive cars were damaged in that neighborhood.
- We used Earth Tech, which been involved in beach projects, as a cleanup contractor.
- Earth Tech made small piles along the beach and brought in a large, yellow off-road dump truck that they used for beach renourishment to consolidate smaller piles into a stockpile in the parking lot.
- In a marina at Pelican Isles, a sailboat that was precariously balanced on the bridge shows how high water was in that area.
- At Vanderbilt Beach, a brick paver area was destroyed where the flagpole stood.
- Sand was scoured away from the beach and destroyed everything, including the walkway, causing a six- to seven-foot drop at the end of the cul-de-sac.
- At Lowdermilk Park, a lot of sand from the beach was washed into the parking lot, and that occurred countywide. That's representative of what happened in the City of Naples at nearly every beach-end, whether it had a walkway or not. There was a lot of sand loss. Almost all crossovers were damaged or destroyed. A lot of sand came into streets and was hauled away.
- We're slowly getting beach-ends back online and hope to have most open relatively soon.
- At Naples Pier the next morning, the last 70 to 100 feet of the pier was gone – all the walls and structures at the end of the pier.
- The pier video camera showed it all happening. As the day progressed, the water got more violent and higher with a lot of energy in the waves. That's how sand traveled to the north.
- In Aqualane Shores, Port Royal and Old Naples, lower floors of structures were hit hard, especially by flooding.
- We moved our tractor and other equipment at Tigertail Beach on Marco Island to higher ground prior to the hurricane, so it was safe, but a utility shed was damaged.
- The Tigertail Beach parking lot area is about elevation 3.0, so you can see the elevation of water is closer to 6-7.
- Marco Island beaches didn't get hit as much debris-wise as northern beaches, so cleanup crews were able to clean up quickly using our equipment and road and bridge equipment, which was loaned.

A discussion ensued and the following points were made:

- Work crews will use bulldozers to push sand back and restore the width of the beaches from the dunes outward, repairing damage from scouring.
- From the dunes outward is fairly flat now because they're gone. As you go seaward, there's a distinct depression along the beaches, a ridgeline at the waterline, but not so much on Marco Island, although there are similar issues there.
- The county has reached out to FDEP to determine if it will allow the county to take that ridgeline and push it over into the depression so we get good, positive drainage from the dune line to the

Gulf, which will make the beach more attractive to tourists and prevent water from standing in that depression and collecting algae and debris that would be undesirable to tourists.

- Emergency berm project. The county is working with FEMA and took a countywide tour from Barefoot Beach to Wiggins Pass, Vanderbilt, the Pelican Bay area and the City of Naples beaches. FEMA was very helpful in giving the county fairly broad directions on how to proceed. Both FEMA and FDEP were impressed by the amount of sand taken from the dune line. What used to be dunes and vegetation is now exposed seawalls.
- The county will be getting an emergency evaluation/monitoring for the emergency berm project, followed by engineering recommendations on how to proceed. FEMA will reimburse the county after we get all the reports on the amount of sand losses.
- FEMA has an emergency berm program that consists of about 6 cubic yards of sand per lineal foot. If you multiply that from R1 to R89, it's not going to be all included, but most will. We're hoping to get a substantial amount of sand put back as an emergency berm that will protect us from a five-year storm, plus a wave runup. That's the intent of the emergency berm.
- We're finishing our field work on the survey effort, which is a beach-wide survey from the dune line out to the depth of closure, which is about 1,000 feet or more offshore.
- Once our engineer gets that data and does his quantity calculations, we'll know how much sand is still in the system and if sand was lost from the system. That sand quantity will be eligible for FEMA reimbursement, but dune lines themselves are eligible for the emergency berm.
- The sand supply for what's no longer in the system can no longer come from the off-shore source the county leased. It's a BOEM (Bureau of Ocean Energy Management) lease for an offshore source in federal waters called Tom's Hill, about 30 miles west of Sanibel Island.
- We're still going to try to take advantage of having that sand if we decide to do a hopper dredge.
- We're going to a workshop next week to meet with FDEP and FEMA. Hopefully, BOEM will be there so we can discuss how we might get a new lease fairly quickly and potentially do a hopper-dredge, if that's the direction we decide to go, and it's still a possibility.
- The other option is a huge truck haul. We don't have the quantities yet, but it's going to be a significant amount of sand, probably more than what we did last year quantity-wise.
- We'll have a better idea on the timing next week. It's been an ongoing process since September 29th or 30th, with phone calls and emails to various agencies to get questions answered about reimbursement.
- We don't want to make any missteps that could cost us future reimbursement, so we're being careful, while still trying to address what must be addressed in a timely fashion.
- From start to finish, it could take a year.

Mr. Brechnitz detailed the ongoing Tigertail Beach park dredging project:

- We started the project and have a couple of dredges onsite.
- The project's scope has changed since Hurricane Ian. Some areas we thought we'd be taking a lot of sand from did not have as much sand, and other areas, such as Tigertail Lagoon, have much more sand than we anticipated.
- The project's intent is to restore the entire lagoon system to 2017 levels, pre-Hurricane Irma conditions. It will extend from the lagoon offshore and the public beach at Hideaway and onto Tigertail. That's what the permit requires.
- The project entails taking a large part of the spit off at the front, where there's a lot of boat traffic, many recreational boats parking there daily and weekends, and then to dredge on through to the Tiger Tail Lagoon and reopen the tidal flow to regain water quality.
- It will increase water quality, plant life and wildlife inside the lagoon.
- The project requires us to build a berm on Sand Dollar Island so the over-wash of sand into the lagoon area doesn't occur. We have some low areas there and what occurs, particularly during storms from the southwest, even if they're not hurricanes, is it gets a lot of sand wash and the

lagoon begins to fill up. So, we're building a large berm along the entire length of that low area to prevent over-wash, and the lagoon from filling up during storm events.

- Our problem is finding enough sand to build the berm high enough to protect areas we need to protect, so we have a sand-borrow area just off the end, which is very close to navigational traffic.
- We're hopeful that in the county's permit to dredge Collier Creek that the city's permit will allow the county to put sand on that portion of Sand Dollar Island because the city can certainly use it.
- This is a \$4 million project that started out as a \$3 million project.
- The project is being paid for by the City of Marco Island's Tax District for Hideaway Beach.
- The city plans to make a formal request to the Coastal Advisory Committee and, if approved, it will move to the TDC. The city will ask for \$600,000 to help with the portion adjacent to the public beach at Tigertail.
- About \$1 million will be spent inside the Hideaway Lagoon.

Chairman Trecker asked if anyone had questions or comments about the emergency-berm plan and presentation.

A discussion ensued and the following points were made:

- The hurricane flattened and destroyed much of the vegetation on beaches and dunes were knocked down.
- Much of the vegetation and dunes in the City of Naples were on private property, not public beaches.
- The county will be meeting with agencies next week to discuss that renourishment.
- From the Old Naples Hotel to south of Naples Pier, the city owns a 60-foot right-of-way for what used to be or what was intended to be Gulf Street, so those private properties have a seaward property line adjacent to the right-of-way. That's where a lot of the dunes and vegetation were.
- Restoration of the dune system within private properties would involve, at minimum, temporary restoration easements that the county has, but probably not as much as needed to fully restore dunes to their pre-Hurricane Ian condition.
- Anything within private properties will probably require an agreement from each property owner all the way down to the beach for anything more permanent than just a temporary-maintenance easement.
- Something of this breadth and extent would involve engagement with private property owners and the public sector. That's a project the county would manage on behalf of the City of Naples, with help from upper management and agencies.
- Next week's meeting with FEMA and FDEP will be an important step in that process.
- County staff has had discussions with City Streets & Stormwater Director Bob Middleton, City Manager Jay Boodheshwar, City Parks, Recreation, Facilities Director Chad Merritt and County Manager Amy Patterson about the strategy.
- If the plan to reinstate the federal lease as a borrow-pit 30 miles offshore is approved, can the county consider using it to restore some local channels, such as the Marco River and Keewaydin, which has been filling in over the years? Are there other potential sources of sand that may become available?
- Restoring local channels would be difficult and would require local permits, including the Army Corps of Engineers.
- After Hurricane Sandy, New York told residents what they planned to do. The local government engineered a plan and the Department of Environmental Conservation agreed to it and issued an after-the-fact permit onsite. Is that something the county can do as emergency relief in a disaster area? (The county can ask FEMA and FDEP next week.)
- Although the county had asked the federal government for a lease renewal for Tom's Hill, it was turned down and expired a year ago because the federal government said the county didn't have

an imminent project planned. Now that the county has an imminent project planned, the federal government may soften its stance, so the county will head in that direction, to do what it planned and ask to use that offshore sand.

- If there are insufficient quantities, Plan B is a truck haul or we could potentially do a combination of the two. The county has options.
- Lee County is worse off than Collier County and also needs sand. There are two mounds at Tom's Hill, T1 and T2, which are both large mounds with millions of yards of sand, so there's probably enough for both counties.
- Collier County also has inland sources and can use that or a combination.
- Local dredging in channels around Keewaydin Island also should be considered.
- Beaches have not officially reopened, although the public is using them. Residents and visitors are responsible for their own safety and welfare.
- The county posted warnings and advised the public that there's debris in the water and sand and possibly more as it washes ashore. The county is asking the public to stay off beaches.
- The Hurricane Ian presentation on the agenda is available online as a PDF at: <https://bit.ly/VIIHurricaneIanPresentation>
- Media sources have created the impression that Gulf's water quality is not safe and other mixed messages. The public should rely on the state Department of Health for water-quality information.
- County Pollution Control employees are working with the Department of Health.
- Issuing information and monitoring is the Department of Health's responsibility but calls for a coordinated approach among various departments.
- Marco Island does its own water-quality testing.
- As water rises in Lake Okeechobee due to Hurricane Ian, there likely will be a release down the Caloosahatchee and it will get worse, not better.
- There's a real possibility of another bad red-tide event in the months ahead.
- The county's emergency plan is for a berm to protect upland structures from a five-year storm, plus the wave runoff.
- Engineers are putting together a report based on survey data that's still being gathered and will come up with a calculation on how high, wide and how much of a berm 6 cubic yards per lineal foot will build.
- Mr. Miller will get back to the board on whether the county had five-year berms.
- A five-year berm reconstructed along the beach is based upon the survey damage and will show what needs to be improved. Potentially, FEMA will pay for an emergency berm.
- The county will eventually get beaches built back to the design standard, which is 100 feet out to mean high-water, and we have berm elevation in our design template. In the long term, the county will get them returned to that condition, but will make some short-term efforts as quickly as possible.
- This likely will take more than a year.
- We'll fill in the ridgeline depression with bulldozers as quickly as possible, if FDEP approves.
- County staff will be able to provide more information at the December CAC meeting.
- The board thanked the coastal team, noting they've been under tremendous stress, yet have done a stellar job.

IX. Old Business

1. Army Corps of Engineers Project

Chairman Trecker said he provided a handout to board members and noted that the long-term resiliency project obviously won't occur in the near future, even more so now that immediate attention must be paid to emergency repairs. The Army Corps project was meant to deal with not just adding sand and building

up the beach to provide protection resiliency but protecting structures and the key infrastructures behind the beach, and, to some extent, inland.

The handout provides a quick review of the project and where it stands. In general, the scope of the project was reduced and we asked Army Corps management for a three-year extension. The request for a waiver was submitted about a year ago and we haven't heard anything yet, but we were assured we'd get an answer, whether it's approved or not, by year's end, so that's a good checkpoint for us.

The proposal is just to wait. There are many things that can be done there, supplemental work to the Army Corps project, even if it goes forward, that may have to be done. If it's turned down – and that's a real possibility – we'll have to start from scratch, and that would be a big deal. Unless the board wants to spend time on this today, he suggests the board deal with it when the time comes.

A discussion ensued and the following points were made:

- The county needs to focus on resiliency. If we don't focus now, it will never happen.
- The City of Miami and Miami-Dade appointed a resiliency staffer, while other communities appointed someone to lead a resiliency team that recommends improvements.
- PBS had a broadcast a couple of weeks ago on resiliency and what Miami is doing, which is migrating away from the water because it's now perceived as dangerous.
- Hurricane Ian wasn't our last and more will come.
- What is the county doing to provide long-term protection, how are we going to deal with the next hurricane and how are we going to provide some protection to valuable structures?
- The City of Naples has a resiliency staff person and our current year's budget funds a resilience study. The city secured a state grant through the state's resiliency program and has contracted with Aecom, a consulting firm, to develop a resiliency plan.
- Resiliency should be looked at countywide, in an integrated way.
- Board members agreed to wait for a response from the Army Corps.
- A CAC Water Quality Subcommittee meeting will be scheduled before the next CAC meeting.

X. Announcements

Chairman Trecker congratulated Eric on his reelection to the Marco City Council and to Jim Burke for another re-election as a North Collier Fire District Commissioner.

Attorney Greene reminded board members that the subcommittee meeting must comply with all Sunshine Law requirements and asked board members not to get together after the meeting to choose a date, but to let Andy and/or Farren help with scheduling a meeting by sending out a one-way communication with possible dates and times.

XI. Committee Member Discussion

None

XII. Next Meeting

December 8, 2022, 1 p.m.

XIII. Adjournment

There being no further business for the good of the County, the meeting was adjourned by order of the Chairman at 1:50 p.m.

Collier County Coastal Advisory Committee

David Trecker, Chairman

These minutes were approved by the Committee on _____, (check one) as presented, ___ or as amended _____.